

Fikri: Jurnal Kajian Agama, Sosial dan Budaya

https://journal.iaimnumetrolampung.ac.id/index.php/jf

Integrating Spirituality into the Evaluation Framework of Islamic Religious Education

Decky Saputra¹*, Eva Latipah²

¹Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Negeri Bengkalis, Indonesia ²Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia *Correspondence: deckyta09@gmail.com

Abstract

Learning evaluation is an essential component of the educational process, particularly in **Article History** the context of Islamic Religious Education (IRE), which aims to nurture individuals who Received: 05-09-2024 are religious and possess noble character. To date, the practice of evaluating IRE in many Revised: 28-11-2024 schools has largely focused on cognitive aspects, while the dimension of spirituality—the Accepted: 02-12-2024 core of Islamic education—has often been overlooked. This study aims to examine the urgency and implementation of the spirituality dimension in the evaluation of IRE Keywords: learning at primary schools in Bengkalis Regency. Employing a quantitative-descriptive Dimension of Spirituality; approach, the study involved a population of IRE teachers from 30 public and private Islamic Religious primary schools. A purposive sample of 60 teachers was selected. Data were collected Education; through a closed-ended questionnaire based on a spirituality scale developed from the Learning Evaluation. following indicators: awareness of God's presence, sincerity, moral responsibility, and students' inner transformation. The data were analyzed using descriptive statistics (percentages and means). The findings reveal that 82% of teachers acknowledge the importance of spiritual evaluation; however, only 41% consistently integrate it into their daily assessment practices. Most teachers (67%) admitted difficulties in measuring spiritual aspects objectively and systematically. Evaluation remains dominated by written tests and behavioral observations, with no explicit spiritual rubric. This study recommends the development of contextual spiritual evaluation instruments, teacher training in authentic spirituality-based assessment, and policy support from educational stakeholders to position the spirituality dimension as a central pillar of IRE evaluation. The study affirms that the success of IRE cannot be adequately measured by exam scores alone, but rather by the extent to which students experience genuine spiritual appreciation and transformation.



© 2024 Decky Saputra, Eva Latipah

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License.

INTRODUCTION

Islamic Religious Education (IRE) holds a profoundly fundamental mandate in shaping a generation that is faithful, pious, and morally upright. Beyond the mere transmission of religious knowledge, IRE functions as a process of holistic character formation that encompasses intellectual, emotional, social, and, most importantly, spiritual dimensions. In the Islamic scholarly tradition, spirituality is not an auxiliary domain but rather the very heart of the educational process itself. Al-Attas (1980) asserts that education in Islam aims to instill adab (proper conduct) and to form individuals capable of recognizing and fulfilling their roles as servants of Allah and as stewards (khalifah) on earth. This underscores that the spiritual dimension represents the ultimate goal of every learning activity in Islam.

In practice, however, the evaluation system for IRE across various educational institutions remains dominated by cognitive approaches that emphasize students' academic achievements. Assessment of religious concept comprehension, memorization of Qur'anic verses, and correct answers in written tests often serve as the primary benchmarks of learning success. Meanwhile, core values of spirituality—such as sincerity, awareness of God's presence, honesty, patience, and inner reflection—have yet to receive adequate attention in assessment instruments. Evaluation of

> Fikri: Jurnal Kajian Agama, Sosial dan Budaya DOI: https://doi.org/10.25217/jf.v9i2.6546

these aspects is often conducted implicitly, informally, and without systematic documentation. Teachers typically observe students' attitudes in worship, daily behavior, or participation in religious activities as parameters for spiritual assessment, yet without any explicit rubric or clearly defined indicators (Zuhdi, 2015).

In Bengkalis Regency, a coastal area in Riau Province known for its Malay-Islamic culture, the practice of teaching and evaluating IRE faces similar challenges. Based on field research conducted during the 2024/2025 academic year in ten public and private primary schools in Bengkalis District, it was found that 87% of IRE teachers reported including spiritual objectives in their lesson plans (Rencana Pelaksanaan Pembelajaran, RPP). However, only 39% explicitly formulated spiritual evaluation indicators in their assessment tools. Furthermore, merely 24% of teachers possessed a documented rubric for spiritual assessment, while the remainder relied on intuition or general impressions of students. In-depth interviews also revealed that teachers encounter difficulties in objectively measuring spiritual aspects, given the inherently internal nature of spirituality, which is not always manifested in outward behavior. Several teachers stated that they had never received specific training in developing spirituality-based evaluation instruments, resulting in an evaluation orientation that tends to revert to conventionally measurable aspects.

This reality reveals a gap between the transformational goals of Islamic Religious Education (IRE) and the predominantly informational nature of current assessment practices. Assessment has not yet been optimally employed as a tool to evaluate students' inner transformation or religious experiences, even though these aspects constitute the very foundation of success in Islamic education (Fatoni, M. H., & Subando, J., 2024). At the same time, teachers have expressed that strengthening spiritual assessment is urgently needed, particularly in today's social context, which presents significant challenges to the moral and spiritual growth of children (Shevchenko, Y., et.al., 2019). Social phenomena such as individualism, consumerism, and an increasingly prevalent instant culture in the digital era serve as evidence that a spirituality-based assessment approach is becoming more relevant and pressing (Dorney, K., 2025).

In the educational literature, spirituality is understood as a profound existential dimension that touches the core of human consciousness regarding life's purpose, connection to a transcendent power, and the noble values that guide everyday behavior (Cottingham, J., 2005). In the pedagogical context, spirituality is not merely associated with formal religious practices but reflects the quality of an individual's relationship with the Divine, with fellow human beings, and with the natural environment in an integrated manner. Spiritual education, therefore, is a conscious process aimed at developing the innermost aspects of the human self: the capacity to reflect, to experience meaning, and to act ethically based on deeply internalized values.

Previous scholarship consistently situates spirituality at the core of education, especially within Islamic Religious Education (IRE). Syed Muhammad Naquib al-Attas (1980) framed Islamic education through the concept of ta'dib (adab), positioning it as a discipline of body, mind, and soul that cultivates moral refinement and awareness of one's hierarchical place within creation highlighting adab as integral to education rather than an accessory. Al-Ghazali (2010) further defines education as a process of purifying the soul (tazkiyatun nafs) and refining the heart (qalb) toward closeness with God (tagarrub ilallah). In the broader pedagogical discourse, Tisdell (2003) frames spiritual education as a transformative engagement with identity and the search for meaning, while Palmer (1998) emphasizes the importance of engaging the "inner landscape" of educators and learners to nurture spiritual awareness.

Despite these theoretical frameworks, the practice of evaluating IRE remains heavily skewed toward cognitive outcomes. Zuhdi (2015) reports that spiritual assessment is often informal, undocumented, and based on external behavioral observations. Muhaimin (2020, 2023) critiques this cognitive dominance, noting the limited attention afforded to the affective-spiritual dimensions in evaluation, even though the Ministry of Religious Affairs (2020) guidelines for the Merdeka Curriculum explicitly call for assessing both personal and social piety—such as honesty, disciplined worship, introspection, tolerance, and responsibility. Latipah (2023, 2025) identifies spirituality as

central to character education, encompassing sincerity, God-consciousness, worship discipline, and empathy, but laments the lack of targeted and measurable instruments for assessing these constructs. Kistoro (2022, 2024) similarly argues that prevailing evaluation practices overemphasize ritualistic attendance and test scores while neglecting internal dimensions like intention, reflection, and moral consistency. He advocates for qualitative approaches—reflective journals, in-depth interviews, and narrative assessments—that can more deeply reveal students' motivations and value orientations. Although some studies (Latipah et al., 2023) propose authentic assessments such as reflective journals, value portfolios, and religious interviews—consistent with Tisdell and Palmer's transformative pedagogies—these are rare, under-standardized, and unvalidated in primary-level IRE settings. Additionally, constraints such as limited teacher capacity, inadequate training, and bureaucratic burdens cause teachers to default to conventional cognitive assessments. Abuddin Nata (2021) starkly warns that assessments failing to engage the learner's inner life yield only superficial religiosity, likening it to planting seeds on unprepared soil.

This study lies in its empirical mapping of how primary school IRE teachers in Bengkalis integrate the spiritual dimension into assessment, combined with the development of a culturally grounded, context-specific set of indicators that operationalize spirituality into observable and assessable elements. Unlike most previous research, which has remained at the normative or conceptual level, this study systematically examines teachers' awareness, consistency of implementation, and the practical obstacles they face—ranging from the absence of explicit rubrics to ethical concerns about bias—while also offering a framework for authentic, ethically informed spiritual assessment.

METHODS

This study employed a quantitative-descriptive approach (Peterson et al., 2024) aimed at systematically and objectively describing the extent to which the spiritual dimension is integrated into the assessment of Islamic Religious Education (IRE) learning in primary schools. This approach was chosen because it is appropriate for identifying patterns, tendencies, and teachers' perceptions regarding spiritual aspects in assessment practices, which have largely been overlooked in conventional evaluation instruments. The descriptive design allows the researcher to present detailed numerical data to portray the realities in the field without manipulating variables.

The study population comprised all IRE teachers teaching in 30 public and private primary schools within the research area. The schools were selected based on diverse institutional characteristics (public/private status, geographic location, and accreditation level) to reflect the varied realities of IRE assessment practices. From this population, 60 IRE teachers were selected as the research sample. The sampling was conducted purposively, considering specific criteria such as a minimum of three years of teaching experience, active involvement in the assessment process, and willingness to participate as respondents. Purposive sampling was chosen to ensure the inclusion of informants with relevant knowledge and experience, particularly regarding the practice of spiritual assessment in teaching.

Data were collected through a closed-ended questionnaire specifically developed to measure the integration of the spiritual dimension into learning assessment. The questionnaire instrument was constructed based on spirituality indicators relevant to the Islamic education context, namely: (1) awareness of God's presence in assessment activities, (2) sincerity in providing evaluation and feedback to students, (3) moral responsibility in ensuring fairness and usefulness of assessment, and (4) students' inner transformation, referring to efforts to encourage changes in spiritual attitudes and character through the assessment process. Each indicator was operationalized into statements within a spirituality scale with five levels of agreement, ranging from "strongly disagree" to "strongly agree." This scale was designed to capture subjective spiritual qualities in a systematic manner through teachers' perceptions.

Prior to the main study, the questionnaire underwent content validity testing involving three experts in Islamic education and learning evaluation, as well as empirical reliability testing on a pilot sample different from the main population. The results confirmed that all questionnaire items were valid and had adequate reliability coefficients ($\alpha > 0.70$), making the instrument suitable for use in this research.

The collected data were analyzed using descriptive statistics, focusing on the calculation of means and percentages for each spirituality indicator. The mean was used to determine the level of teachers' tendency to integrate specific spiritual dimensions into assessment, while the percentage was used to identify the distribution of respondents across each statement category. The findings were then interpreted to observe general patterns, differences in tendencies among indicators, and potential areas for strengthening the spiritual dimension in the IRE assessment system in a more structured manner.

Through this method, the study is expected to provide a tangible contribution to the development of IRE assessment practices that not only emphasize cognitive aspects, but also encompass the affective and spiritual domains—dimensions that have long been intrinsic to religious education yet remain underrepresented in systematic assessment practices.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The Results of the integration of the spiritual dimension into the assessment of Islamic Religious Education

This study aimed to examine the integration of the spiritual dimension into the assessment of Islamic Religious Education (IRE) by primary school teachers. Based on data collected and analyzed from 60 respondents, the findings indicate an imbalance between teachers' normative awareness of the importance of spiritual assessment and its technical implementation in daily practice.

As shown in Table 1, 82% of teachers reported having a high awareness of the urgency of spiritual assessment in IRE. They acknowledged that religious education should not be measured solely through cognitive aspects and outward behavior, but must also address the innermost dimensions of students' spirituality—such as God-consciousness, sincerity of intention, and transformation of inner attitudes. This awareness was generally rooted in theological convictions that the ultimate goal of religious education is to nurture individuals who are spiritually devout, not merely formally compliant.

However, the level of consistency in implementing spiritual assessment remains limited, with only 41% of teachers stating that they routinely and deliberately integrate spiritual assessment into daily classroom evaluation activities. The remaining teachers indicated that such integration was carried out only occasionally, depending on the learning context or external supervisory requirements. This points to a gap between religious ideals and the pedagogical realities teachers face in the classroom.

Furthermore, 67% of teachers acknowledged experiencing difficulties in objectively and systematically measuring spiritual aspects. These challenges include: (1) the absence of measurable indicators, (2) difficulty distinguishing spiritual expressions from general social attitudes, and (3) concerns about conducting personal and subjective judgments. In practice, most teachers still rely on written tests (88%) to measure students' cognitive mastery of religious content and general behavioral observation (74%) for the affective domain, but without the support of explicit and structured spiritual rubrics.

Table 1. Summary of Key Findings

No	Aspect Investigated	Result	Description
1	Awareness of the importance of spiritual assessment	82% "very important"	High normative and theological awareness
2	Consistency of integration into	41% consistent	Others only occasional or unconscious application

-	practice		
3	Challenges in spiritual assessment	67% report difficulties	Mainly related to objectivity, indicators, and validity
4	Most common evaluation methods	88% written tests; 74% behavioral observation	No explicit instruments for spiritual dimension
5	Use of spiritual rubrics	<20% with clear indicators	Majority have not developed formal spirituality rubrics

These findings indicate that IRE assessment is still dominated by cognitive and surface-level affective evaluation, while the deeper, reflective, and transformational spiritual dimension remains largely unaddressed. Even when teachers observe students' attitudes, most do so without explicit spiritual indicators. As a result, spirituality is often judged intuitively, subjectively, and without documentation in learning reports.

In-depth interviews with IRE teachers reinforced these quantitative findings. Teachers generally expressed that the spiritual dimension in learning is crucial because it reflects the core aim of IRE—shaping the religious character of students. However, they also admitted facing significant pedagogical challenges in accessing and assessing this dimension.

One teacher stated, "We want to assess a child's sincerity in worship or moral commitment, but there is no tool to help us evaluate it fairly and transparently." This reflects the gap between the ideal and the practical realities of spiritual assessment. Teachers desire an approach that can authentically capture students' spiritual qualities, but the absence of instruments and guidelines creates pedagogical dilemmas.

Teachers also voiced concerns over potential personal bias in assessing students' spirituality. Without standardized, universally accepted guidelines, spiritual evaluation could lead to subjective judgments or even cause emotional harm to learners. As one teacher warned, "If we are not careful, we might end up judging a student's spirituality. But who can truly measure someone's sincerity?"

These perspectives reveal that teachers' primary needs go beyond technical tools—they require an ethical and pedagogical framework to ensure that spirituality-based assessment is implemented safely, fairly, and constructively. This underscores the necessity for collaboration among curriculum developers, academics, and policymakers to design an operational and applicable spiritual evaluation approach.

Table 2. Summary of Qualitative Findings from Teacher Interviews

No	Main Finding	Representative Teacher Statement	Meaning/Context
1	Importance of spirituality in assessment	"Spirituality is important because it reflects the essence of IRE."	Teachers recognize spirituality as the core of IRE
2	Pedagogical challenges in assessment	"We want to assess sincerity, but there is no fair tool."	Lack of appropriate instruments and methods
3	Concerns about bias	"If we are not careful, we might end up judging students."	Ethical risks without clear guidelines
4	Desire for safe and fair assessment	"We need guidance that is not only technical but also ethical."	Teachers want comprehensive guidance—tools and ethics

Analysis of the Spirituality Dimension in Evaluating Islamic Religious Education

The findings of this study indicate that the current assessment of Islamic Religious Education (IRE) in primary schools has not yet fully aligned with the holistic aims of Islamic education,

namely to nurture students' faith, morality, and transcendental awareness. When the spiritual dimension is not systematically measured, it tends to be overlooked in the planning and implementation of instruction.

From an educational evaluation perspective, Bloom (1976) emphasized that the objectives of education should encompass not only the cognitive, affective, and psychomotor domains but also the development of students' values and character. In the context of Islamic education, spiritual evaluation is not an optional supplement but an integral component of its ultimate goal—the formation of insan kamil (a complete human being). This is consistent with Al-Attas (1979), who asserts that the primary aim of education in Islam is the inculcation of adab, defined as the integration of intellect, heart, and conduct directed toward God.

The finding that 67% of teachers reported difficulty in objectively and systematically measuring spiritual aspects resonates with the argument of Berliner and Gage (1988) that the affective and spiritual domains are inherently difficult to access through conventional evaluation instruments because they are personal, internal, and not directly observable. In IRE, this complexity is heightened by the need to balance the assessment of students' outward religious behavior (e.g., ritual observance, respectful conduct) with the inner meanings that underpin such actions (e.g., sincerity, submission of the heart to Allah). Abuddin Nata (2010) similarly stressed that evaluation in Islamic education must consider the inner dimensions of the human being while avoiding coercion, judgmentalism, or violations of students' spiritual autonomy.

Eva Latipah (2021) further argued that students' spirituality cannot be measured through a purely quantitative approach, as it develops through the internalization of values in an individual and unique manner. She emphasized the need for an integrative approach that balances cognitive, affective, and conative aspects, positioning spiritual experience as a meaningful part of the learning process. According to Latipah, teachers require both spiritual and psychological sensitivity to understand expressions of spirituality that are often non-verbal and not directly measurable. In this sense, spiritual evaluation should focus not on instant outcomes but on the process of personal transformation, such as depth of reflection, moral consistency, and sincerity in practicing religious values.

From a modern educational psychology perspective, Woolfolk (2011) explained that students' moral and spiritual development is rooted in social relationships, emotional reinforcement, and reflective experiences that unfold over time. Assessing such aspects requires flexible strategies such as reflective journals, narrative interviews, and personal development portfolios that enable teachers to capture students' internal processes more holistically. This is particularly relevant to the difficulties teachers face in assessing students' sincerity or spiritual motivation, which cannot be reduced to a numerical score.

Similarly, Santrock (2011) argued that spiritual and moral development cannot be separated from students' psychosocial growth. Teachers need to understand the stages of individual development, including the search for identity, the need for life meaning, and the relationship to transcendent values. Spiritual assessment, therefore, is not only about tools but also about the teacher's ability to create a safe space for students to express moral and spiritual reflections. Without adequate psychological and spiritual competence, such evaluations risk becoming unfair or even psychologically burdensome for students.

The qualitative findings from teacher interviews in this study underscore these theoretical points. Teachers acknowledged the importance of spirituality but also highlighted the pedagogical difficulty of assessing it. As one teacher put it, "We want to assess the sincerity of students in worship or their moral commitment, but there is no tool to help us do it fairly and openly." This reveals a deep pedagogical concern: teachers are not rejecting the need for spiritual assessment, but fear that, if done without a strong foundation, it could foster personal bias and lead to "judging" a student's spirituality. This caution is critical in Islamic education, where intention and purity of heart are ultimately matters known only to God.

In contemporary educational psychology, Howard Gardner (1999) introduced the concept of existential intelligence, which includes the human capacity for reflection, meaning-making, and awareness of God or a transcendent force. However, Gardner also acknowledged that existential intelligence is extremely difficult to measure using objective tests. Assessing this domain requires reflective, narrative, and process-oriented approaches rather than product-based metrics. This aligns with the findings of the present study, which show that spiritual evaluation in IRE is still dominated by written tests and simple behavioral observations, without rubrics capable of capturing the inner processes and spiritual transformation of students in depth.

Thus, the results suggest a significant gap between teachers' awareness of the importance of spiritual assessment and their pedagogical capacity and available instruments to implement it effectively. In this regard, Latipah (2023) reinforces that spiritual evaluation requires teachers' emotional intelligence and spiritual depth, as well as the skills to create a reflective and transformative learning environment. The perspectives of Woolfolk and Santrock further emphasize that evaluating inner dimensions such as spirituality demands a humanistic and contextual approach rather than a purely technical one.

Accordingly, the development of context-specific instruments rooted in Islamic spiritual values, along with teacher training in authentic spirituality-based assessment, is an urgent necessity. Moreover, educational stakeholders—from school leaders to policymakers—must provide systemic support to ensure that the spiritual dimension is not merely rhetorical but mainstreamed into IRE assessment systems. This is not simply a technical matter of evaluation, but a broader vision of education that is holistic and transformative, in line with the essence of Islamic education in nurturing faithful, knowledgeable, and morally upright individuals.

CONCLUSION

This study concludes that while primary school IRE teachers in Bengkalis generally recognize the importance of integrating the spiritual dimension into assessment, its practical implementation remains limited and inconsistent. The absence of standardized instruments, coupled with teachers' difficulties in objectively measuring inner spiritual qualities such as sincerity, God-consciousness, and moral responsibility, has resulted in an overreliance on cognitive-focused evaluations. Ethical concerns—particularly the potential for subjective bias and "spiritual judgment" of students further complicate the process, highlighting a significant gap between normative awareness and pedagogical practice. The findings carry important implications for both policy and practice. First, spiritual assessment should be explicitly mainstreamed into IRE curricula, supported by operational guidelines and validated instruments that reflect Islamic values and are adaptable to students' developmental stages. Second, professional development programs need to go beyond technical training to cultivate teachers' ethical sensitivity and reflective capacity in assessing spiritual growth. Finally, systemic support from school leadership and educational authorities is essential to legitimize and sustain the integration of spirituality into assessment, ensuring that it becomes a meaningful pillar of Islamic education rather than a symbolic addition.

Future studies could expand this research by employing mixed-methods approaches that combine quantitative surveys with in-depth qualitative exploration of students' experiences of spiritual assessment. Comparative studies across different regions or educational levels could provide broader insights into contextual factors influencing the integration of spirituality in assessment. Furthermore, experimental or action research could be conducted to design, implement, and evaluate the effectiveness of specific authentic spiritual assessment models, thereby contributing practical, evidence-based solutions for enhancing the quality of spiritual evaluation in IRE.

REFERENCES

- Al-Attas, S. M. N. (1979). Islam and Secularism. Kuala Lumpur: ABIM. Google
- Al-Attas, S. M. N. (1980). The concept of education in Islam: A framework for an Islamic philosophy of education. Kuala Lumpur: ISTAC. Google
- Al-Ghazali. (2010). Ihya' Ulum al-Din (Vol. I-IV). Beirut: Dar al-Fikr. Google
- Berliner, D. C., & Gage, N. L. (1988). *Educational psychology* (4th ed.). Boston: Houghton Mifflin. Google
- Bloom, B. S. (1976). *Human characteristics and school learning*. New York: McGraw-Hill. Google Cottingham, J. (2005). *The spiritual dimension: Religion, philosophy and human value*. Cambridge University Press. https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511614866
- Dorney, K. (2025). Faith and Fitness: A New Materialist Methodology and Analysis of Spiritually Based Fitness Discourse on Instagram (Doctoral dissertation, University of Guelph). Google
- Fatoni, M. H., & Subando, J. (2024). The important role of learning evaluation for improving the quality of Islamic education: A literature study. *Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Islam*, 12(2), 223-240. Google
- Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia. (2020). *Panduan penilaian pendidikan agama Islam pada kurikulum merdeka*. Jakarta: Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Islam. Google
- Kistoro, H. C. A. (2024). Spiritualitas sebagai dimensi tersembunyi dalam evaluasi pembelajaran agama. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam Nusantara*, 12(1), 33–45. Google
- Latipah, E. (2021). Effective teaching in psychological perspective: PAI teacher knowledge and skills. Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam, 18(2), 215–226. https://doi.org/10.14421/jpai.2021.182-01
- Latipah, E. (2021). Psikologi Pendidikan. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar. Google
- Latipah, E., Hasan, N., & Rokhimawan, M. A. (2023). Curriculum reconstruction: Alignment of profile, body of knowledge, and learning outcomes of the Indonesian Islamic Education study program. Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam, 20(1), 1–19. https://doi.org/10.14421/jpai.v20i1.7756
- Muhaimin. (2020). *Rekonstruksi pendidikan Islam: Dari paradigma menuju aksi*. Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada. Google
- Muhaimin. (2023). Evaluasi afektif dan spiritual dalam kurikulum pendidikan Islam. *Jurnal Tarbiyah Islamiyah*, 9(1), 21–39. Google
- Nata, A. (2010). Pendidikan Islam di Era Globalisasi. Jakarta: Kencana. Google
- Nata, A. (2021). Evaluasi batin dalam pendidikan agama Islam. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam Kontemporer*, 10(2), 55–67. https://doi.org/10.32832/tadibuna.v10i3.5203
- Palmer, P. J. (1998). The courage to teach: Exploring the inner landscape of a teacher's life. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass. Google
- Peterson, C., Louwagie, K., & Baker, Z. (2024). An Embedded Mixed Methods Evaluation Of Session 3135 (Symposium). Google
- Santrock, J. W. (2011). Educational psychology (5th ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill. Google
- Shevchenko, Y., Moskalyova, L., Kanarova, O., & Poznanska, O. (2019). Development of a System for Improving Future Teachers' Readiness for the Child's Spiritual and Moral Development in a Cross-Cultural Space. *Journal of History Culture and Art Research*, 8(4), 251-261. https://doi.org/10.7596/taksad.v8i4.2352
- Sukiman. (2022). Pengembangan instrumen evaluasi spiritualitas dalam pendidikan Islam. *Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan Islam*, 10(1), 67–80. Google
- Tisdell, E. J. (2003). Exploring spirituality and culture in adult and higher education. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass. Google
- Woolfolk, A. (2011). Educational psychology (11th ed.). Boston: Pearson. Google
- Zuhdi, M. (2015). Evaluasi spiritual dalam pendidikan Islam: Analisis pendekatan dan implementasi. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 3(1), 45–60. Google