

The Effect of Learning Media on Language Competence in Elementary School Students: Meta-Analysis Study

Novi Asmarani Kusuma Dewi¹, Siti Rochmiyati², Wan Irham Ishak³

^{1,2} Universitas Sarjanawiyata Tamansiswa Yogyakarta, Indonesia

³ Universiti Teknologi MARA Kedah Branch, Malaysia

 nuphieasmara85@gmail.com*

ABSTRACT

Language competency is a complex ability related to four skills at once. Many studies also state that using media in learning can improve language competence. For this reason, the research results should be evaluated to determine whether the study results can be trusted and accounted for statistically. For this reason, this research aims to compile and statistically evaluate the results of an independent study that examines learning media on language competence in elementary school students. The research method used is meta-analysis research. The study search was conducted from 2018 to 2023 in the Google Scholar database. The search results provided 108 studies that met the inclusion requirements for extraction, resulting in 111 data comparisons being examined. Calculate the magnitude of the effect of learning media on language competence in elementary school students using Microsoft Excel. This research obtained an effect size of 2.180 in the Very Large category, with a mean population correlation coefficient of 0.581. These results indicate a positive influence between the learning media teachers use on elementary school students' language competence. For this reason, it is recommended to develop or use media in language learning so that elementary school students' language competence can increase, in addition to the need for further research involving many studies related to this competence.

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received

December 29, 2022

Revised

October 11, 2023

Accepted

November 12,

2023

Keywords: *Language Competence, Learning Media, Meta-Analysis Study*

Journal Homepage

<http://journal.iainnumetrolampung.ac.id/index.php/ji/>

This is an open access article under the CC BY SA license

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>

INTRODUCTION

Language competence is a person's ability to express their intentions or goals using language that follows linguistic knowledge or linguistic rules (Hall & Valdiviezo, 2020; Troesch et al., 2016; Zubkov, 2020). Language competence is essential for social competence because students must understand others and communicate effectively to demonstrate their social skills (Erlinawati, 2018). Language competency is a complex ability related to listening, speaking, reading and writing (Mediana et al., 2022; Pramesti, 2015). Language competence is essential for all individuals (Zein & Puspita, 2021). Language competence is a model for developing students' intellectual, social and character abilities (Magdalena et al., 2021). Language is the most critical tool for communication (Alqahtani, 2015).

Previous research showed that children's language competence was still relatively low (Delfita, 2012; Erlinawati, 2018; Zein & Puspita, 2021) as stated by

Erlinawati (2018), who said that 75% of Nagan Raya Elementary School students were declared not to have achieved the specified Minimum Graduation Criteria scores. Apart from that, it can also be seen from students' difficulty in answering questions from teachers and the low ability of students to convey ideas, so students tend to be silent while at school (Zein & Puspita, 2021). Apart from that, other research results state that low language competence is caused by students being unable to communicate fluently, not being able to name the correct vocabulary, and not being able to answer the teacher's questions (Delfita, 2012). To communicate well, language competence must be trained and mastered by students (Dayu & Anggrasari, 2017; Zubkov, 2020). Sometimes, language competence is classified into oral and written (Kusuma & Makhbubah, 2022; Yuliana, 2017). Oral language or oration ability combines speaking and reading abilities, while written language competence combines listening and reading abilities.

Listening skill is listening to verbal symbols with full attention, understanding, appreciation and interpretation to obtain information, capture content and understand the meaning of communication that is not conveyed (Ekawati, 2017; Fajriani & Kurnia, 2021; A. W. Sari, 2016). Listening skills are a person's first skill (Adnyani, 2018; Aziza & Muliansyah, 2020). People often have difficulty honing their listening skills because they must understand the conversation's gist (Fitriani et al., 2023). Besides that, the listener must focus their attention on an exchange so that the main point of the discussion does not have a double meaning. For this reason, as social creatures, students should be able to listen because students are always in contact with other people by communicating (Barseli et al., 2019; Sholihah et al., 2018).

Listening skills will impact their learning achievement (Damayanti & Watini, 2022; R. Pratiwi, 2022). Students who are not proficient in listening will have difficulty capturing information. As a result, he did not understand the material being taught. He also cannot convey his understanding in written and spoken language. As a result, learning achievement is low. Thus, teachers should not underestimate listening skills. Teachers must teach their students the best way to listen so that students have adequate listening skills (Yulisa, 2018). It is hoped that listening skills can support students to achieve brilliant achievements and utilise their knowledge to benefit their environment.

Speaking is conveying messages through spoken language (Yulisa, 2018). The skill to communicate is to utter articulatory sounds or words to express and share thoughts, ideas and feelings (Damayanti & Watini, 2022). Speaking ability supports reading and writing skills, so speaking ability is an ability that students must master (Imawan & Ashadi, 2019; Pranoto & Suprayogi, 2020). Speaking skills are divided into vocabulary, syntax (grammar), semantics and phonemes (word sounds) (Pradita & Jayanti, 2021). With speaking skills, a person can convey various kinds of information (facts, events, ideas, responses, etc.), convince the listener, desire the listener's physical action or reaction, inform and please the listener, express wishes and desires, and express various kinds of information (Moore et al., 2018; Wahyuni et al., 2021). The listeners will better understand someone with good speaking skills (Margareta, 2023; Moore et al., 2018).

Previous research showed low speaking ability (Aritonang, 2023; Susanti, 2016). Susanti (2018) stated that the conventional learning methods used were the cause of students' soft speaking skills. Apart from that, Aritonang (2023) said that internal factors such as students' physical and mental conditions, students' passivity during the teaching and learning process, students' lack of self-confidence, and constant feelings

of fear cause students' low speaking ability, apart from being caused by the way teachers teach in class, such as the learning methods and learning media used. The same thing was also expressed in that the low speaking ability of elementary school students was caused by the use of learning media that was not by the students' characteristics.

Reading skill is a child's ability to recognize letters and words, connect them with sounds, and understand the meaning of the writing they read, which begins with hearing the notes correctly and precisely (Martini & Sueca, 2023; Sela et al., 2022; Utami et al., 2023). Reading is an essential part of human life because, as a gateway to knowledge, someone who can read and write can get the information needed to increase their knowledge. Reading for elementary school students is a complex ability that must be mastered gradually during development (Azkia & Rohman, 2020; Mualimah & Usmaedi, 2018). Because there is a gradual process to achieve a student who is considered able to read, this is the basis for the importance of reading ability for lower-grade students. A child's initial language competence is his mother's language (Park, 2019; Yeni et al., 2022), so children raised by a talkative mother who talks a lot will tend to develop language more quickly. Conversely, children raised by quiet and speech-impaired mothers will have difficulty speaking until they grow up, so almost All education experts agree that stories are a vibrant language-learning medium.

Previous research results stated that elementary school students' reading ability was still relatively low. This can be seen from international studies such as the Student Assessment Program, which shows that the results of students' reading literacy skills in Indonesia score below the average (OECD, 2016; Sadler & Zeidler, 2009; Sellar & Lingard, 2014), the Progress in International Reading Literacy Study also stated that reading comprehension in Indonesia is still relatively low (Mullis et al., 2012, 2015; Watts, 2015), because elementary school students in Indonesia have the reading ability of elementary school students in class IV of 25% reaching the intermediate level, 30% getting the deficient level, 40% achieving the low level, and only 5% reaching the advanced and high level. This previously also expressed the same results of interviews with teachers, and observations showed that most elementary school Number 3 Nagri Kaler students did not have good reading comprehension skills (Ambarita et al., 2021).

Writing skills are expressing ideas, opinions and feelings to other parties through written language (Nur et al., 2021; Situmorang, 2018). The accuracy of the language, vocabulary, grammar, and spelling must support the accuracy of expressing ideas. Writing skills include several abilities, namely the ability to use appropriate language elements, the ability to organize discourse in the form of an essay, and the ability to use appropriate language and other word choices.

Writing is one of the student outcomes in the learning process, and this skill is included in the psychomotor domain. Writing is a productive and expressive activity. In language learning at school, students need to be skilled in writing. This is following one of the objectives of learning Indonesian: students must be able to write texts. Apart from that, writing skills are a language competence used to communicate indirectly, not face to face, with other people. Writing activities are not as easy as expected. Students still don't have ideas for writing. The writing learning process does not pay enough attention and does not follow the writing goals of elementary school students, so students' writing skills are still low (Dafit, 2017). This condition aligns with the observations made on first-grade students at the Elementary School of Nurul Huda Islamic that their writing ability is still relatively low because as many as 50% of students have not yet achieved their writing ability (Nurlaily & Pranata, 2022).

Much research has been trying to improve students' language competence by using learning media in connection with this condition. Such as improving speaking skills in elementary school students by using hand puppet learning media (Cahyani et al., 2022; Juliati, 2023; Khairunnisa & Aryani, 2018; Oktaviani et al., 2021; Santy et al., 2022; Ustari, 2018), media of learning in the form of puppets or drawings (Antari et al., 2019; Dumaini & Ardhiani, 2023; Pujiasti et al., 2022; Puspitasari et al., 2023; Sukmadewi & Ganing, 2020), and interactive media such as youtube, tik tok, video, and film (Elvira et al., 2020; Nisa, 2022; C. P. Pratiwi & Widyaningrum, 2022; Santoso & Sukartiningsih, 2021; S. Wulandari et al., 2021). Likewise with the reading ability of elementary school students who use popular learning media such as pop-up books (D. P. Sari, 2021; N. Sari & Liansari, 2023), Big Book (Erfinawati et al., 2021; Purwanti & Apriliani, 2019; Sareng et al., 2023), comic books (Irfan & Islamiati, 2021; Nurhidaya et al., 2023). Likewise, to improve writing and listening skills, several researchers also use learning media (Cahyani et al., 2022; Rahayu & Saputra, 2022; I. F. Wulandari et al., 2023). With the large amount of research that has been carried out, it is necessary to review the data and translate it into simpler terms. It also proves the hypothesis that has been confirmed so far: that using learning media influences students' language competence. For this reason, this research aims to look at and statistically evaluate the findings of an independent study which examined the effect or influence of learning media on language competence in elementary school students in Indonesia. For the aim of this research to be achieved, it was carried out by determining the effect size to see, evaluate and prove the hypothesis used by researchers.

METHOD

Quantitative research with meta-analysis was used in this research. A meta-analysis is a combination of the results of several studies on a specific research question that is intended to summarise all the evidence on a particular topic, which can be used to arrive at more accurate and reliable conclusions than individual studies (Borenstein et al., 2021; Suurmond et al., 2017). Meta-analysis research allows researchers to (1) provide more accurate estimates of the effect size or strength of relationships between variables, (2) detect potential reasons for differences in results by using this analysis to see whether individual study results are generally consistent or highly inconsistent, and (3) helps discover what might influence the results, such as differences in study design, sample characteristics, or analysis methods (Demirel & Dağyar, 2016; Glass, 1977).

In general, meta-analysis research uses effect size to measure differences between two groups, which has many advantages compared to statistical significance tests alone (Cumming, 2013; Grgurović et al., 2013). A meta-analysis study followed the following steps: First, identify the problem; second, look for literature related to the problem. Studies achieved in the literature are coded according to specific criteria; and third, statistical analysis of the research is performed, and the findings are interpreted (Retnawati et al., 2018; Yunita et al., 2021).

This research aims to look at and evaluate statistically the findings of an independent study which examined the effect or influence of learning media on language competence in elementary school students in Indonesia. The results of this research can at least be used as material to determine the urgency of research into the development of learning media or other learning tools.

The article criteria used for this research are the results of a study involving the effectiveness or influence of learning media on language competence in elementary

school students. In this research, language competence is a person's ability to express ideas about oneself, understand other people, and learn new vocabulary or other languages. Language competencies include four skills that cannot be separated from one another because they are interconnected: speaking, listening, reading and writing (Erlinawati, 2018; Susini & Ndruru, 2021).

The research results on the effectiveness or influence of learning media on language competence have been published in scientific journals or proceedings. The results of this research can be obtained using the Google Scholar search engine using the keywords learning media, speaking skills, listening skills, reading skills and writing skills. The search results obtained more than 45,000 articles on the effectiveness or influence of learning media on language competence.

The research results included in this analysis were selected from experimental or quasi-experimental research. The research included in the synthesis is in the publication range between 2018 and 2023. In addition, the articles used for the synthesis must show the t-test results and the research sample size used. Based on these inclusion criteria, 108 research results were included in this study. The selected research results comprised 111 pairs of comparisons because two studies focused on two effects of language competence, and one focused on implementing two media. The list of research results used in this research can be seen in Table 1.

Table 1. List of research results used as the subject of meta-analysis.

| No | Author (Year) | Effects of Language Competence | Type of Learning Media |
|-----|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------------|
| 1. | Hidayanti et al. (2018) | Writing | Poster |
| 2. | Khairunnisa & Aryani (2018) | Speaking | Hand Puppet |
| 3. | Maula (2018) | Listening | Hand Puppet |
| 4. | Pratiwi et al. (2018) | Writing | Film |
| 5. | Susanti et al. (2018) | Writing | Song lyrics |
| 6. | Tristanto & Sutikno (2018) | Writing | Song |
| 7. | Triyawan et al. (2018) | Listening | Audio |
| 8. | Ustari (2018) | Speaking | Hand Puppet |
| 9. | Wahyuningtyas & Rukmi (2018) | Writing | Audio Visual |
| 10. | Anggraini et al. (2019) | Writing | Flash Card |
| 11. | Anriyani (2019) | Writing | Sketch Drawings |
| 12. | Antari et al. (2019) | Speaking | Drawings |
| 13. | Artini (2019) | Writing | Audio Visual |
| 14. | Cahyani et al. (2019) | Writing | Audio Visual |
| 15. | Darsana et al. (2019) | Reading | Drawings |
| 16. | Dewi et al. (2019) | Writing | Visual |
| 17. | Fatonah (2019) | Listening | Video of Animation |
| 18. | Ihsan et al. (2019) | Speaking | Puzzle |
| 19. | Lukmanulhakim & Uswatun (2019) | Writing | Scrapbook |
| 20. | Munirahet et al. (2019) | Writing | Drawings of Series |
| 21. | Pratama et al. (2019) | Listening | Visual |
| 22. | Pratika et al. (2019) | Writing | Video of Animation |

| No | Author (Year) | Effects of Language Competence | Type of Learning Media |
|-----|---------------------------------|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| 23. | Purwanti & Apriliani (2019) | Reading | Big Book |
| 24. | Putri et al. (2019) | Reading | Flip Chart |
| 25. | Saraswati (2019) | Reading | Drawings |
| 26. | Sari et al. (2019) | Listening | Audio Visual |
| 27. | Sholihah & Subrata (2019) | Reading | MIKSUPAJA |
| 28. | Andriyati et al (2020) | Listening | Hand Puppet |
| 29. | Aristhi & Manuaba (2020) | Writing | Drawings |
| 30. | Elvira et al. (2020) | Speaking | Animation |
| 31. | Khaliq et al. (2020) | Listening | Hand Puppet |
| 32. | Minarsih & Putra (2020) | Speaking | Tape recorder |
| 33. | Nurrohmah et al. (2020) | Writing | Pop-Up Book |
| 34. | Pertiwi & Kolen (2020) | Writing | Film |
| 35. | Pratiwi et al. (2020) | Speaking | Multimedia |
| 36. | Putri et al. (2020) | Writing | Flashcard |
| 37. | Rohmanurmeta (2020) | Writing | Tutorial Animation |
| 38. | Sukmadewi & Ganing (2020) | Speaking | Comic |
| 39. | Susilo et al. (2020) | Writing | Big Book |
| 40. | Utami et al. (2020) | Writing | Puzzle |
| 41. | Wulandari et al. (2020) | Reading | video of animation |
| 42. | Yusron et al. (2020) | Speaking | Pop-Up Book |
| 43. | Aziz (2021) | Writing | Colour letter |
| 44. | Burhan et al. (2021) | Writing | Drawings |
| 45. | Erfianawati (2021) | Reading | Big Book and Bamboo BMGame APP |
| 46. | Ernawati (2021) | Reading | Movable Alphabet |
| 47. | Hilwaet et al. (2021) | Writing | Puppet |
| 48. | Irfan & Islamiati (2021) | Reading | Comic |
| 49. | Marini & Turnip (2021) | Listening | Audio Visual |
| 50. | Mila & Anafiah (2021) | Listening | Puppet |
| 51. | Ningsih et al. (2021) | Speaking | Pop-Up Book |
| 52. | Pranata et al. (2021) | Writing | Film of Animation |
| 53. | Raharjayanti & Widagdo (2021) | Listening | Youtube |
| 54. | Santoso & Sukartiningsih (2021) | Speaking | Tik tok |
| 55. | Sari (2021) | Reading | Pop-Up Book |
| 56. | Setiawan & Putra (2021) | Writing | Website |
| 57. | Wulandari et al. (2021) | Speaking | Youtube |
| 58. | Amini & Gunayasa (2022) | Writing | Mysterious Card Box |
| 59. | Aryanti et al. (2022) | Listening | Audio Visual |
| 60. | Auliannisa et al. (2022) | Speaking | Treasure Hunt |
| 61. | Bamualim et al. (2022) | Speaking | Post Box |
| 62. | Cahyani et al. (2022) | Speaking | Hand Puppet |
| 63. | Ferawati et al. (2022) | Speaking and Writing | Scrapbook |

| No | Author (Year) | Effects of Language Competence | Type of Learning Media |
|------|----------------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------------|
| 64. | Husniyah (2022) | Listening | DORA |
| 65. | Kiftia & Rukmi (2022) | Listening | Video of Animation |
| 66. | Ninawati et al. (2022) | Speaking | Concrete Object |
| 67. | Ningsih et al. (2022) | Reading | Flashcard |
| 68. | Nisa (2022) | Speaking | Video of Animation |
| 69. | Nurbaiti et al. (2022) | Listening | Audio Visual |
| 70. | Oktavia & Jupri (2022) | Listening | Film of Animation |
| 71. | Pratiwi & Zulfadewina (2022) | Listening | Audio Visual |
| 72. | Pratiwi et al. (2022) | Writing | Audio Visual |
| 73. | Pujiastuti et al. (2022) | Speaking | Drawings |
| 74. | Putri & Kasriman (2022) | Reading | Smart Board |
| 75. | Rachmawati et al. (2022) | Writing and Reading | Big Book |
| 76. | Rahayu & Saputra (2022) | Writing | literasi visual |
| 77. | Rahmah & Amaliya (2022) | Speaking | Big Book |
| 78. | Riyanto et al. (2022) | Reading | Video of Tutorial |
| 79. | Rohana et al. (2022) | Reading | Story Stript |
| 80. | Santy et al. (2022) | Speaking | Hand Puppet |
| 81. | Wardono & Kurniawati (2022) | Listening | Hand Puppet |
| 82. | Yulinawati et al. (2022) | Speaking | Audio Visual |
| 83. | Yunika et al. (2022) | Speaking | Pop-Up Book |
| 84. | Aprillia et al. (2023) | Reading | Comic |
| 85. | Auliya & Nuroh (2023) | Reading | Story Jumper |
| 86. | Azzahro & Wati (2023) | Writing | Comic |
| 87. | Cahyanti et al. (2023) | Writing | Photovoice |
| 88. | Dumaini & Ardhiani (2023) | Speaking | Puppet of Paper |
| 89. | Ermawati et al. (2023) | Listening | Cartoon Puppet |
| 90. | Frasandy et al. (2023) | Listening | Cartoon Puppet |
| 91. | Hamdiyah & Puspitasari (2023) | Writing | Animation |
| 92. | Juliati (2023) | Speaking | Hand Puppet |
| 93. | Latifaturrohdita & Linggo (2023) | Reading | Scrapbook |
| 94. | Lestari et al. (2023) | Speaking | Smart Bottle |
| 95. | Nurameiyah et al. (2023) | Listening | Film of Animation |
| 96. | Nurhidayah et al. (2023) | Reading | Storybook |
| 97. | Oktaviani et al. (2023) | Speaking | Hand Puppet |
| 98. | Puspitasari et al. (2023) | Speaking | Comic |
| 99. | Rahayu et al. (2023) | Writing | Crossword Puzzle |
| 100. | Rohimah et al. (2023) | Reading | Flashcard |
| 101. | Sakina et al. (2023) | Listening | Audio Visual |
| 102. | Saputri & Subrata (2023) | Writing | Drawings of Series |
| 103. | Sareng et al. (2023) | Reading | Big Book |
| 104. | Sari (2023) | Speaking | Drawings pf Art |
| 105. | Sari & Liansari (2023) | Reading | Pop Up Book |

| No | Author (Year) | Effects of Language Competence | Type of Learning Media |
|------|-------------------------|--------------------------------|------------------------|
| 106. | Satekti et al. (2023) | Listening | Puppet of Fabel |
| 107. | Wulandari et al. (2023) | Listening | Audio Visual |
| 108. | Zakiyah et al. (2023) | Reading | Flashcard |

The instruments in this meta-analysis were carried out using a coding category sheet (Retnawati et al., 2018; Yunita et al., 2021). The coding form follows predetermined characteristics: the researcher's name, study year, research design used, sample size and t-test calculation results. This form of coding was developed to increase reliability in the studies' suitability. Apart from that, to see information related to research results that meet the inclusion criteria, see Table 2.

Table 2. Study Characteristics Obtained

| Characteristics | | f |
|---------------------|--------------|-----|
| Effect | Reading | 24 |
| | Writing | 35 |
| | Listening | 23 |
| | Speaking | 29 |
| Year of Publication | 2018-2019 | 27 |
| | 2020-2021 | 31 |
| | 2022-2023 | 53 |
| Sample size | More than 30 | 66 |
| | Less than 30 | 45 |
| Type of Publication | proceeding | 6 |
| | Journal | 105 |

Data analysis in meta-analysis research is carried out by (1) calculating the effect size, (2) transforming the values from the t-test to r, and (3) estimating the impact of sampling (Cooper et al., 2019; Widodo et al., 2023; Yunita et al., 2021). To determine the effect size value from the t-test results, namely $ES = t \sqrt{\frac{1}{n_e} + \frac{1}{n_c}}$ (Widodo et al., 2023).

This effect size calculation results are compared with the criteria determined by Yunita et al. (2021) as in Table 3.

Table 3. Effect Size Category

| Effect Size | Interpretation |
|----------------|----------------|
| 0.00 – 0.19 | Ignored |
| 0.20 – 0.49 | Small |
| 0.50 – 0.79 | Fair |
| 0.80 – 1.29 | Large |
| More than 1.30 | Very large |

To transform values from the t-test into the r coefficient, you can use the formula $r = \frac{t}{\sqrt{t^2+(N-2)}}$ (Widodo et al., 2023). Calculate the impact of sampling, which can be done using the bare-bones meta-analysis method (Cumming, 2013; Hu & Yang, 2021).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

From 111 pairs of comparisons originating from 108 research results used as research subjects, the results of calculating the effect size from the t-test coefficient can be seen in Table 4.

Table 4. Effect Size For Learning Media on Language Competence

| Author (Year) | Language Competence | N | t-Test | Effect size | r | N x r | (r - \bar{r}) ² |
|--------------------------------|---------------------|----|--------|-------------|-------|--------|-------------------------------|
| Hidayanti et al. (2018) | Writing | 40 | 10.800 | 3.415 | 0.868 | 25.698 | 0.074 |
| Khairunnisa & Aryani (2018) | Speaking | 44 | 4.663 | 1.406 | 0.584 | 12.506 | 0.000 |
| Maula (2018) | Listening | 40 | 2.029 | 0.642 | 0.313 | 26.049 | 0.081 |
| Pratiwi et al. (2018) | Writing | 55 | 3.915 | 1.056 | 0.474 | 63.348 | 0.015 |
| Susanti et al. (2018) | Writing | 70 | 17.540 | 4.193 | 0.905 | 30.083 | 0.095 |
| Tristanto & Sutikno (2018) | Writing | 48 | 5.455 | 1.576 | 0.627 | 30.984 | 0.001 |
| Triyawan et al. (2018) | Listening | 38 | 8.450 | 2.742 | 0.815 | 29.072 | 0.048 |
| Ustari (2018) | Speaking | 41 | 6.280 | 1.962 | 0.709 | 24.973 | 0.013 |
| Wahyuningtyas & Rukmi (2018) | Writing | 55 | 3.710 | 1.002 | 0.454 | 20.800 | 0.020 |
| Anggraini et al. (2019) | Writing | 52 | 3.086 | 0.856 | 0.400 | 43.177 | 0.039 |
| Anriyani (2019) | Writing | 52 | 10.536 | 2.922 | 0.830 | 34.292 | 0.055 |
| Antari et al. (2019) | Speaking | 46 | 7.419 | 2.188 | 0.745 | 38.997 | 0.022 |
| Artini (2019) | Writing | 55 | 7.320 | 1.974 | 0.709 | 28.850 | 0.013 |
| Cahyani et al. (2019) | Writing | 72 | 3.659 | 0.862 | 0.401 | 25.175 | 0.038 |
| Darsana et al. (2019) | Reading | 80 | 2.928 | 0.657 | 0.315 | 40.531 | 0.079 |
| Dewi et al. (2019) | Writing | 66 | 6.225 | 1.533 | 0.614 | 15.615 | 0.000 |
| Fatonah (2019) | Listening | 32 | 3.062 | 1.083 | 0.488 | 33.824 | 0.012 |
| Ihsan et al. (2019) | Speaking | 40 | 9.765 | 3.088 | 0.846 | 51.756 | 0.062 |
| Lukmanulhakim & Uswatun (2019) | Writing | 68 | 9.533 | 2.312 | 0.761 | 23.145 | 0.027 |
| Munirah et al. (2019) | Writing | 70 | 2.889 | 0.691 | 0.331 | 18.039 | 0.071 |
| Pratama et al. (2019) | Listening | 50 | 2.680 | 0.759 | 0.361 | 19.149 | 0.056 |
| Pratika et al. (2019) | Writing | 56 | 2.674 | 0.715 | 0.342 | 17.772 | 0.065 |
| Purwanti & Apriliani (2019) | Reading | 36 | 3.310 | 1.103 | 0.494 | 38.362 | 0.011 |
| Putri et al. (2019) | Reading | 41 | 16.559 | 5.174 | 0.936 | 23.621 | 0.115 |
| Saraswati (2019) | Reading | 70 | 2.956 | 0.000 | 0.337 | 15.921 | 0.067 |
| Sari et al. (2019) | Listening | 63 | 2.040 | 0.514 | 0.253 | 23.123 | 0.118 |
| Sholihah & Subrata (2019) | Reading | 54 | 3.417 | 0.930 | 0.428 | 34.040 | 0.028 |
| Andriyati et al. (2020) | Listening | 38 | 12.093 | 3.923 | 0.896 | 36.535 | 0.090 |
| Aristhi & Manuaba (2020) | Writing | 77 | 4.668 | 1.065 | 0.474 | 34.818 | 0.015 |
| Elvira et al. (2020) | Speaking | 40 | 10.900 | 3.447 | 0.870 | 17.526 | 0.075 |
| Khaliq et al. (2020) | Listening | 60 | 2.326 | 0.021 | 0.292 | 45.904 | 0.093 |
| Minarsih & Putra (2020) | Speaking | 62 | 8.532 | 2.168 | 0.740 | 14.029 | 0.021 |
| Nurrohmah et al. (2020) | Writing | 16 | 6.822 | 3.411 | 0.877 | 15.162 | 0.079 |

| Author (Year) | Language Competence | N | t-Test | Effect size | r | N x r | (r - \bar{r}) ² |
|---------------------------------|---------------------|-----|--------|-------------|-------|--------|-------------------------------|
| Pertiwi & Kolen (2020) | Writing | 64 | 1.920 | 0.480 | 0.237 | 30.941 | 0.129 |
| Pratiwi et al. (2020) | Speaking | 59 | 4.650 | 1.219 | 0.524 | 19.211 | 0.005 |
| Putri et al. (2020) | Writing | 81 | 2.170 | 0.483 | 0.237 | 21.047 | 0.129 |
| Rohmanurmeta (2020) | Writing | 45 | 3.470 | 1.041 | 0.468 | 42.277 | 0.017 |
| Sukmadewi & Ganing (2020) | Speaking | 73 | 5.986 | 1.405 | 0.579 | 24.418 | 0.000 |
| Susilo et al. (2020) | Writing | 40 | 4.751 | 1.502 | 0.610 | 31.989 | 0.000 |
| Utami et al. (2020) | Writing | 53 | 5.406 | 1.485 | 0.604 | 20.914 | 0.000 |
| Wulandari et al. (2020) | Reading | 58 | 2.893 | 0.760 | 0.361 | 24.165 | 0.056 |
| Yusron et al. (2020) | Speaking | 30 | 7.193 | 2.627 | 0.806 | 13.121 | 0.044 |
| Aziz (2021) | Writing | 42 | 2.080 | 0.642 | 0.312 | 32.284 | 0.081 |
| Burhan et al. (2021) | Writing | 42 | 7.600 | 2.345 | 0.769 | 23.080 | 0.030 |
| Erfianawati (2021) | Reading | 70 | 2.880 | 0.688 | 0.330 | 23.287 | 0.071 |
| Erfianawati (2021) | Reading | 70 | 2.909 | 0.695 | 0.333 | 24.424 | 0.070 |
| Ernawati (2021) | Reading | 60 | 3.394 | 0.876 | 0.407 | 14.127 | 0.036 |
| Hilwa et al. (2021) | Writing | 40 | 2.327 | 0.736 | 0.353 | 35.973 | 0.059 |
| Irfan & Islamiati (2021) | Reading | 64 | 5.351 | 1.338 | 0.562 | 49.363 | 0.001 |
| Marini & Turnip (2021) | Listening | 54 | 16.260 | 4.425 | 0.914 | 15.168 | 0.101 |
| Mila & Anafiah (2021) | Listening | 38 | 2.612 | 0.849 | 0.399 | 44.355 | 0.039 |
| Ningsih et al. (2021) | Speaking | 60 | 8.360 | 2.159 | 0.739 | 19.917 | 0.020 |
| Pranata et al. (2021) | Writing | 60 | 2.680 | 0.692 | 0.332 | 33.443 | 0.070 |
| Raharjayanti & Widagdo (2021) | Listening | 51 | 6.080 | 1.703 | 0.656 | 11.817 | 0.004 |
| Santoso & Sukartiningsih (2021) | Speaking | 20 | 3.107 | 1.389 | 0.591 | 35.608 | 0.000 |
| Sari (2021) | Reading | 49 | 7.252 | 2.072 | 0.727 | 11.203 | 0.017 |
| Setiawan & Putra (2021) | Writing | 70 | 1.337 | 0.320 | 0.160 | 23.599 | 0.190 |
| Wulandari et al. (2021) | Speaking | 30 | 6.742 | 2.462 | 0.787 | 14.612 | 0.036 |
| Amini & Gunayasa (2022) | Writing | 40 | 2.419 | 0.765 | 0.365 | 20.998 | 0.053 |
| Aryanti et al. (2022) | Listening | 40 | 3.802 | 1.202 | 0.525 | 36.648 | 0.005 |
| Auliannisa et al. (2022) | Speaking | 56 | 6.360 | 1.700 | 0.654 | 29.361 | 0.003 |
| Bamualim et al. (2022) | Speaking | 32 | 12.638 | 4.468 | 0.918 | 29.520 | 0.103 |
| Cahyani et al. (2022) | Speaking | 68 | 3.915 | 0.950 | 0.434 | 31.920 | 0.026 |
| Ferawati et al. (2022) | Speaking | 38 | 9.289 | 3.014 | 0.840 | 28.852 | 0.059 |
| Ferawati et al. (2022) | Writing | 38 | 7.000 | 2.271 | 0.759 | 2.211 | 0.027 |
| Husniyah (2022) | Listening | 30 | 0.391 | 0.143 | 0.074 | 98.405 | 0.273 |
| Kiftia & Rukmi (2022) | Listening | 106 | 25.470 | 4.948 | 0.928 | 16.251 | 0.110 |
| Ninawati et al. (2022) | Speaking | 30 | 3.410 | 1.245 | 0.542 | 29.382 | 0.003 |
| Ningsih et al. (2022) | Reading | 53 | 4.757 | 1.309 | 0.554 | 42.008 | 0.002 |
| Nisa (2022) | Speaking | 56 | 8.336 | 2.228 | 0.750 | 52.116 | 0.024 |
| Nurbaiti et al. (2022) | Listening | 54 | 26.580 | 7.234 | 0.965 | 17.979 | 0.136 |
| Oktavia & Jupri (2022) | Listening | 60 | 2.392 | 0.618 | 0.300 | 47.341 | 0.088 |
| Pratiwi & Zulfadewina | Listening | 56 | 11.630 | 3.108 | 0.845 | 15.933 | 0.062 |

| Author (Year) | Language Competence | N | t-Test | Effect size | r | N x r | (r - \bar{r}) ² |
|-----------------------------------|---------------------|----|--------|-------------|-------|--------|-------------------------------|
| (2022) | | | | | | | |
| Pratiwi et al. (2022) | Writing | 52 | 2.276 | 0.631 | 0.306 | 30.849 | 0.084 |
| Pujiantuti et al. (2022) | Speaking | 34 | 12.207 | 4.187 | 0.907 | 23.415 | 0.097 |
| Putri & Kasriman (2022) | Reading | 60 | 3.228 | 0.833 | 0.390 | 23.378 | 0.042 |
| Rachmawati et al. (2022) | Writing | 40 | 4.440 | 1.404 | 0.584 | 17.314 | 0.000 |
| Rachmawati et al. (2022) | Reading | 40 | 2.960 | 0.936 | 0.433 | 7.852 | 0.027 |
| Rahayu & Saputra (2022) | Writing | 20 | 1.811 | 0.810 | 0.393 | 19.243 | 0.042 |
| Rahmah & Amaliya (2022) | Speaking | 62 | 2.529 | 0.643 | 0.310 | 13.394 | 0.082 |
| Riyanto et al. (2022) | Reading | 31 | 2.580 | 0.968 | 0.432 | 6.981 | 0.027 |
| Rohana et al. (2022) | Reading | 48 | 0.997 | 0.288 | 0.145 | 63.617 | 0.203 |
| Santy et al. (2022) | Speaking | 88 | 9.703 | 2.069 | 0.723 | 29.503 | 0.016 |
| Wardono & Kurniawati (2022) | Listening | 34 | 9.876 | 3.387 | 0.868 | 16.000 | 0.074 |
| Yulinawati et al. (2022) | Speaking | 34 | 3.017 | 1.035 | 0.471 | 22.077 | 0.016 |
| Yunika et al. (2022) | Speaking | 40 | 4.080 | 1.292 | 0.552 | 24.171 | 0.002 |
| Aprillia et al. (2023) | Reading | 41 | 4.558 | 1.424 | 0.590 | 54.549 | 0.000 |
| Auliya & Nuroh (2023) | Reading | 60 | 16.626 | 4.293 | 0.909 | 54.955 | 0.098 |
| Azzahro & Wati (2023) | Writing | 60 | 17.380 | 4.487 | 0.916 | 32.438 | 0.102 |
| Cahyanti et al. (2023) | Writing | 40 | 8.544 | 2.702 | 0.811 | 25.105 | 0.046 |
| Dumaini & Ardhiani (2023) | Speaking | 32 | 6.930 | 2.455 | 0.785 | 10.506 | 0.035 |
| Ermawati et al. (2023) | Listening | 20 | 2.619 | 1.171 | 0.525 | 39.316 | 0.005 |
| Frasandy et al. (2023) | Listening | 40 | 32.910 | 10.407 | 0.983 | 25.126 | 0.149 |
| Hamdiyah & Puspitasari (2023) | Writing | 50 | 4.027 | 1.139 | 0.503 | 33.459 | 0.009 |
| Juliaty (2023) | Speaking | 34 | 31.316 | 10.741 | 0.984 | 57.426 | 0.150 |
| Latifaturroddhita & Linggo (2023) | Reading | 60 | 25.154 | 6.495 | 0.957 | 25.729 | 0.130 |
| Lestari et al. (2023) | Speaking | 34 | 6.548 | 2.246 | 0.757 | 13.655 | 0.026 |
| Nurameiyah et al. (2023) | Listening | 30 | 2.705 | 0.988 | 0.455 | 36.839 | 0.020 |
| Nurhidayah et al. (2023) | Reading | 42 | 11.550 | 3.564 | 0.877 | 5.406 | 0.079 |
| Oktaviani et al. (2023) | Speaking | 60 | 0.689 | 0.178 | 0.090 | 44.929 | 0.256 |
| Puspitasari et al. (2023) | Speaking | 60 | 8.605 | 2.222 | 0.749 | 25.347 | 0.023 |
| Rahayu et al. (2023) | Writing | 58 | 3.636 | 0.955 | 0.437 | 37.690 | 0.025 |
| Rohimah et al. (2023) | Reading | 48 | 8.600 | 2.483 | 0.785 | 24.138 | 0.036 |
| Sakina et al. (2023) | Listening | 46 | 4.089 | 1.206 | 0.525 | 33.401 | 0.005 |
| Saputri & Subrata (2023) | Writing | 46 | 7.005 | 2.066 | 0.726 | 37.122 | 0.017 |
| Sareng et al. (2023) | Reading | 54 | 6.826 | 1.858 | 0.687 | 39.841 | 0.008 |
| Sari (2023) | Speaking | 40 | 68.917 | 21.793 | 0.996 | 28.519 | 0.160 |
| Sari & Liansari (2023) | Reading | 40 | 6.268 | 1.982 | 0.713 | 48.724 | 0.014 |
| Satekti et al. (2023) | Listening | 54 | 15.092 | 4.108 | 0.902 | 29.654 | 0.094 |
| Wulandari et al. (2023) | Listening | 58 | 4.452 | 1.169 | 0.511 | 37.028 | 0.007 |
| Zakiyah et al. (2023) | Reading | 48 | 8.222 | 2.373 | 0.771 | 25.698 | 0.031 |

| Author (Year) | Language Competence | N | t-Test | Effect size | r | N x r | (r - \bar{r}) ² |
|---------------|---------------------|------|--------|-------------|----|----------|-------------------------------|
| Total | | 5545 | -- | 241.973 | -- | 3225.581 | 6.011 |

Based on Table 4, it is found that the average effect size is $\frac{241.973}{111} = 2.180$. This shows that the effect of learning media on language competence in elementary school students is very high. This indicates a positive influence between the media used in language learning and elementary school students' language competence.

Determining the effect of sampling can be done by (1) transforming the value of the t-test to the correlation of r , (2) calculating the mean of population correlation(\bar{r}), (3) calculating the variance of population correlation ($\sigma^2 r$), and (4) calculating the variance of error sampling ($\sigma^2 e$). Based on Table 4, it is obtained that the mean of population correlation is $\frac{N \times r}{N} = \frac{3225.581}{5545} = 0.581$, and variance of population correlation is $\frac{\sum(r - \bar{r})^2}{2} = \frac{6.011}{2} = 3.0055$. For this reason, the sampling error variance is $\frac{(1 - \bar{r}^2)^2}{N-1} = \frac{(1 - (0.581)^2)^2}{5545-1} = \frac{0.4388}{5544} = 0.000079$, so the impact of sampling error is $\frac{\sigma^2 e}{\sigma^2 r} \times 100\% = \frac{0.000079}{3.0055} \times 100\% = 0.002628\%$.

The smaller percentage of error in sampling indicates that the possibility of error bias due to errors in sampling is smaller. The calculation results showed that the percentage error in the sample was 0.002628%, or the percentage error result was close to 0%. This indicates that the error bias due to errors in sampling in research on the effects of learning media on language competence in elementary school students is significantly smaller.

DISCUSSION

Language competence is a person's ability to express their intentions or goals using language that is by linguistic knowledge or linguistic rules (Hall & Valdiviezo, 2020; Troesch et al., 2016; Zubkov, 2020). Language competence is essential for all individuals (Erlinawati, 2018; Mediana et al., 2022; Pramesti, 2015). This is because language competence is a model for developing students' intellectual, social and character abilities. Language is the most critical tool for communication (Alqahtani, 2015; Misnawati et al., 2022).

To communicate well, there are four language competencies that students must practice and master. These four competencies are listening, speaking, reading and writing (Mediana et al., 2022; Pramesti, 2015). Sometimes, these four language competencies are classified into oral and written language competence (Kusuma & Makhbubah, 2022; Yuliana, 2017). Oral language or oration ability combines speaking and reading abilities, while written language competence combines listening and reading abilities. Language learning in schools (including elementary schools) is intended to improve communication skills and language competence (Latifah, 2019; Magdalena et al., 2021). One aspect that supports improving excellent and accurate communication and language competence is mastering a lot of vocabulary (Magdalena et al., 2021; Taslim et al., 2019). The more words students master, the smoother and better the communication and language they use. Vocabulary is an important part that cannot be separated from the learning process. With the same understanding of words, teachers and students can interact and communicate smoothly in the teaching and

learning process in class. However, if students' knowledge of words is lacking, the teaching and learning process will be hampered, and the learning material will be difficult for students to understand.

The results of research so far indicate that students have studied Indonesian, but their current Indonesian language competence is still quite worrying (A. S. Pratiwi, 2016; Siregar, 2021). This is evidenced by the low test scores for Indonesian language subjects during exams. Not only that, we often look at spoken and written language skills. Few young people today are confused when given scientific work assignments or other scientific assignments that pay attention to the rules of using Indonesian (Purnamasari & Hartono, 2023). Apart from that, further research results reveal that improving language skills can be done using models, methods and media in language learning. Use of learning models such as Talking Stick, ATIK, and Flipped Classroom: so far, it can be concluded that it can improve students' language competence (Herwati & Watini, 2022; R. A. Lestari & Watini, 2023; Y. Lestari et al., 2023; Megawati et al., 2013; Robbaniah et al., 2023). Apart from that, the use of learning methods such as singing, telling stories, and reading aloud can be concluded it can improve students' language competence (Endahwati et al., 2022; Qomaruddin, 2017; Saribu & Hidayah, 2019). Likewise, the use of learning media such as hand puppets (Cahyani et al., 2022; Khairunnisa & Aryani, 2018; Oktaviani et al., 2021; Santy et al., 2022; Ustari, 2018). learning media in the form of puppets or pictures (Antari et al., 2019; Dumaini & Ardhiani, 2023; Hilwa et al., 2021; Milla et al., 2022; Puspitasari et al., 2023; Sukmadewi & Ganing, 2020; Zafira & Artharina, 2017), interactive media such as YouTube, tik tok, video, and film (Elvira et al., 2020; Nisa, 2022; R. Pratiwi, 2022; Santoso & Sukartiningisih, 2021; S. Wulandari et al., 2021), concrete learning media such as pop-up books (D. P. Sari, 2021; N. Sari & Liansari, 2023), Big Book (Erfinawati et al., 2021; Purwanti & Apriliani, 2019; Rachmawati et al., 2022), comic book (Irfan & Islamiati, 2021; Nurhidaya et al., 2023), and audiovisual media (C. P. Pratiwi & Widyaningrum, 2022; R. Pratiwi, 2022; I. F. Wulandari et al., 2023). So far, this research can be concluded to improve students' language competence.

Learning media are all tools or materials used in the learning process to help students understand and master the subject matter (Widodo, 2018). This media can be in physical objects, technology, or both designed to communicate information more effectively and facilitate understanding and retention of learning concepts (Jonassen et al., 1994; Salomon, 2012). Learning media is a tool for conveying messages to students (Daryanto, 2010; Mahnun, 2012). Media use in learning is one of the efforts made by teachers to achieve learning goals. In this case, the learning media aims to make education more engaging, enjoyable, and interactive, helping students with content better (Hakim et al., 2019). The results of meta-analysis research can be used to support or invalidate hypotheses made by previous researchers. In the case of the current research, the hypothesis used by research is "the learning media used has a positive effect on language competence in elementary school students". If the results of this meta-analysis support the hypothesis used by researchers, then statistically, the results strengthen the research that researchers have carried out. When referring to the research stages of learning media product development, meta-analysis research can be used as a preliminary study to see the urgency of learning media.

From the results of the meta-analysis that has been carried out, it is found that the average effect size is 2.180 in the very large category, with a mean population correlation coefficient of $\bar{r} = 0.581$. These results indicate a positive influence between the learning media teachers use on elementary school students' language competence.

In addition, the analysis results show that the percentage of sampling error is 0.002628%. Hence, the possibility of error bias in concluding due to errors in sampling is very small because it is close to 0%. This means that previous research shows that it can be generalized to the population and scientifically justified. Based on these results, it can be concluded that, in general, learning media can improve language competence in elementary school students.

This research shows that, statistically, learning media affects language skills in elementary school students. For this reason, the implications of this research include the need to use media in language learning so that students' language skills can increase. This is in line with the function of the media, namely conveying messages to students and providing stimulus to students so that learning becomes more meaningful. This research generally measures the effect of learning media on language competence in elementary school students. Apart from that, this research only measures experimentally and quantitatively results. In addition, research results must include sample size and t-tests. In other words, analysis that does not contain this information, meta-analysis, was not carried out in this study. This is what causes the limitations of this research

From this research, there are several recommendations for further research in the future. As time goes by, many studies will emerge from new authors regarding the influence of payment media on language competence in elementary school students. This condition can increase the number of studies analyzed from previous meta-analytic studies. As more studies are analyzed, a trend towards changes in the effects is likely. Apart from that, it is hoped that researchers can use media in language learning to improve students' language competence.

CONCLUSION

In this research, 108 studies from 2018 to 2023 were analyzed. The meta-analysis results obtained an effect size of 2.180 in the very large category, with a mean population correlation coefficient of $r = 0.581$. Based on these results, it can be concluded that the effect of learning media on language competence in elementary school students is in the very high category. So that teachers can use learning media to improve students' language competence. Apart from that, further research is needed to develop learning media to improve students' language competence. Other recommendations for researchers include that further research needs to be carried out because, as time continues, more research will emerge from new authors regarding the influence of learning media on students' language competence. This condition can increase the number of studies analyzed from previous meta-analysis studies. The more studies examined, the more likely the effects will change. Apart from that, researchers hope

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We would like to thank Assistant Professor Eka Fitria Ningsih, M.Pd from Universitas Ma'arif Lampung, for his discussion on quantitative meta-analysis

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTION STATEMENT

NAKD is Conceptualization, design, editing/reviewing, supervision, analysis, Writing, and interpretation. SR: reviewing, supervision, and final approval.

REFERENCES

- Adnyani, N. W. S. (2018). Metode total physical response (TPR) untuk pengembangan kemampuan mendengarkan dalam pembelajaran bahasa Inggris bagi anak usia dini. *Pratama Widya: Jurnal Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini*, 3(2). <https://doi.org/10.25078/pw.v3i2.735>
- Alqahtani, M. (2015). The importance of vocabulary in language learning and how to be taught. *International Journal of Teaching and Education*, 3(3), 21–34. <https://doi.org/10.20472/TE.2015.3.3.002>
- Ambarita, R. S., Wulan, N. S., & Wahyudin, D. (2021). Analisis kemampuan membaca pemahaman pada siswa sekolah dasar. *Edukatif: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, 3(5), 2336–2344. <https://doi.org/10.31004/edukatif.v3i5.836>
- Antari, N. M. W., Arini, N. W., & Sumantri, M. (2019). Pengaruh model pembelajaran word square berbantuan media gambar terhadap keterampilan berbicara. *Jurnal Penelitian Dan Pengembangan Pendidikan*, 3(3), 174–182. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jppp.v3i3.18160>
- Aritonang, H. A. P. (2023). *Analisis faktor penghambat kemampuan berbicara siswa kelas rendah di sekolah dasar* [Skripsi]. Universitas Jambi.
- Aziza, L. F., & Muliansyah, A. (2020). Keterampilan berbahasa arab dengan pendekatan komprehensif. *El-Tsaqafah: Jurnal Jurusan PBA*, 19(1), 56–71. <https://doi.org/10.20414/tsaqafah.v19i1.2344>
- Azkia, N., & Rohman, N. (2020). Analisis metode montessori dalam meningkatkan kemampuan membaca permulaan siswa SD/MI kelas rendah. *Al-Aulad: Journal of Islamic Primary Education*, 3(2), 69–77. <https://doi.org/10.15575/al-aulad.v3i2.7917>
- Barseli, M., Sembiring, K., Ifdil, I., & Fitria, L. (2019). The concept of student interpersonal communication. *JPPI: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Indonesia*, 4(2), 129–134. <http://dx.doi.org/10.29210/02018259>
- Borenstein, M., Hedges, L. V., Higgins, J. P. T., & Rothstein, H. R. (2021). *Introduction to meta-analysis*. John Wiley & Sons. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9780470743386>
- Cahyani, A., Tahir, M., & Setiawan, H. (2022). Pengaruh media boneka tangan (hand puppet) terhadap keterampilan berbicara siswa. *Journal of Classroom Action Research*, 4(2). <https://doi.org/10.29303/jcar.v4i1.1683>
- Cooper, H., Hedges, L. V., & Valentine, J. C. (2019). *The handbook of research synthesis and meta-analysis*. Russell Sage Foundation.
- Cumming, G. (2013). *Understanding the new statistics: Effect sizes, confidence intervals, and meta-analysis*. Routledge.
- Dafit, F. (2017). Keefektifan kemampuan menulis kreatif siswa sd dengan model pembelajaran multiliterasi. *GERAM*, 5(1), 49–57.
- Damayanti, Y., & Watini, S. (2022). Peran TV sekolah dalam meningkatkan kemampuan menyimak anak usia dini. *JIIP-Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Pendidikan*, 5(7), 2646–2653. <https://doi.org/10.54371/jiip.v5i7.737>
- Daryanto. (2010). *Media pembelajaran: peranannya sangat penting dalam mencapai tujuan pembelajaran*. Gava Media.
- Dayu, D. P. K., & Anggrasari, L. A. (2017). Pengaruh penggunaan media big book writing terhadap keterampilan menulis bahasa indonesia siswa kelas 5 SD negeri 1 Pilangbango Madiun. *Al-Bidayah: Jurnal Pendidikan Dasar Islam*, 9(1), 21–32. <https://doi.org/10.14421/al-bidayah.v9i1.114>

- Delfita, R. (2012). Meningkatkan kemampuan berbahasa anak melalui permainan gambar dalam bak pasir di Taman Kanak-Kanak Bina Anaprasa Mekar Sari Padang. *Jurnal Ilmiah Pesona PAUD*, 1(5). <https://doi.org/10.24036/1700>
- Demirel, M., & Dağyar, M. (2016). Effects of problem-based learning on attitude: a meta-analysis study. *EURASIA Journal of Mathematics, Science & Technology Education*, 12(8), 2115–2137. <https://doi.org/10.12973/eurasia.2016.1293a>
- Dumaini, N. K. D., & Ardhiiani, G. A. N. (2023). Pengaruh model pembelajaran role playing berbantuan media wayang kertas terhadap keterampilan berbicara bahasa indonesia. *Jurnal Lampuhyang*, 14(2), 160–176. <http://e-journal.stkip-amlapura.ac.id>
- Ekawati, Y. N. (2017). Peningkatan Kemampuan mendengarkan (listening) mahasiswa bahasa inggris melalui model pembelajaran “project-based learning.” *Cakrawala: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 11(2), 135–143. <https://doi.org/10.24905/cakrawala.v11i2.121>
- Elvira, F. S., Roshayanti, F., & Baedhowi, S. (2020). Efektifitas model problem based learning berbantuan media animasi terhadap keterampilan berbicara dan hasil belajar. *Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran*, 4(3), 511–521. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jipp.v4i3.25502>
- Endahwati, M., Bachri, B. S., & Izzati, U. A. (2022). Efektivitas Metode pembelajaran read aloud dengan media buku cerita gambar seri untuk meningkatkan kemampuan berbahasa reseptif dan ekspresif pada anak usia dini. *Jurnal Pajar (Pendidikan Dan Pengajaran)*, 6(1), 163. <http://dx.doi.org/10.33578/pjr.v6i1.8496>
- Erfinawati, Ismawirna, & Yulsaflie. (2021). Pengaruh media big book literasi dan media aplikasi bamboo bmgame app terhadap keterampilan membaca siswa kelas awal sd negeri 33 banda aceh. *Serambi Akademica: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sains, Dan Humaniora*, 9(4), 639–645. <https://doi.org/10.32672/jsa.v9i4.3067>
- Erlinawati, E. (2018). Peningkatan kemampuan berbahasa melalui bermain di kelas. *Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Anak (JIPA)*, 3(4), 154–164.
- Fajriani, C., & Kurnia, S. D. (2021). Penerapan metode bermain peran dalam mengembangkan kemampuan bahasa pada anak usia dini kelompok b di taman kanak-kanak nurul yaqin Desa Uloe Kecamatan Dua Bocoe Kabupaten Bone. *Educhild: Journal of Early Childhood Education*, 2(2), 68–79.
- Fitriani, D., Abdillah, M. S., & Etikasari, D. (2023). Upaya meningkatkan kemampuan berbicara dengan metode diskusi pada siswa kelas VII MTs Ma’arif 01 Punggur Lampung Tengah. *Prosiding Seminar Akademik Pendidikan Bahasa Dan Sastra Indonesia*, 1(1), 16–21.
- Glass, G. V. (1977). 9: Integrating findings: the meta-analysis of research. *Review of Research in Education*, 5(1), 351–379. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0091732X005001351>
- Grgurović, M., Chapelle, C. A., & Shelley, M. C. (2013). A meta-analysis of effectiveness studies on computer technology-supported language learning. *ReCALL*, 25(2), 165–198. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0958344013000013>
- Hakim, L. L., Alghadari, F., & Widodo, S. A. (2019). Virtual manipulatives media in mathematical abstraction. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, 1315(1). <https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1315/1/012017>
- Hall, J., & Valdiviezo, S. (2020). The social worker as language worker in a multilingual world: Educating for language competence. *Journal of Social Work Education*, 56(1), 17–29. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10437797.2019.1642275>
- Herwati, J. C., & Watini, S. (2022). Implementasi Model ATIK dalam Mengembangkan Kemampuan Mendongeng pada Anak Usia Dini di PAUD Siera Pertiwi. *Edukasia: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran*, 3(2), 207–209.

- Hilwa, N., Nurasiah, I., & Lyesmaya, D. (2021). Pengaruh Media Wayang Sukuraga Terhadap Keterampilan Menulis Deskripsi Pada Siswa Kelas Tinggi Sekolah Dasar. *Primary: Jurnal Pendidikan Guru Sekolah Dasar*, 10(6), 1482. <https://doi.org/10.33578/jpfkip.v10i6.8428>
- Hu, X., & Yang, Y. (2021). What makes online reviews helpful in tourism and hospitality? A bare-bones meta-analysis. *Journal of Hospitality Marketing & Management*, 30(2), 139–158. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19368623.2020.1780178>
- Imawan, M. R., & Ashadi, A. (2019). Audiobooks for assisting EFL students in reading independently. *Journal of English Language Teaching and Linguistics*, 4(1), 77-86. <http://dx.doi.org/10.21462/jeltl.v4i1.198>
- Irfan, M., & Islamiati, N. (2021). Pengaruh Media Komik terhadap Keterampilan Membaca Cerpen. *Jurnal Onoma: Pendidikan, Bahasa Dan Sastra*, 7(1), 125–131. <https://doi.org/10.30605/onoma.v7i1.608>
- Jonassen, D. H., Campbell, J. P., & Davidson, M. E. (1994). Learning with media: Restructuring the debate. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 42(2), 31-39. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02299089>
- Juliatyi. (2023). Media Boneka Tangan: Pengaruhnya Terhadap Keterlambatan Berbicara Anak. *Syifaul Qulub: Jurnal Bimbingan Dan Konseling Islam*, 4(1), 10–20. <https://doi.org/10.32505/syifaulqulub.v4i1.5930>
- Khairunnisa, & Aryani, D. (2018). Penerapan Media Boneka Tangan dalam Keterampilan Berbicara Siswa Kelas IIIb MI At-Thayyibah. *AL-ADZKA, Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Guru Madrasah Ibtidaiyah*, 8(2), 102–116. <http://dx.doi.org/10.18592/aladzkapgmi.v8i2.2366>
- Kusuma, D., & Makhabubah, N. (2022). Penerapan Metode SAS (Struktur Analitik Sintetik) Pada Pembelajaran Membaca Permulaan Siswa Kelas 1 SD. *Jendela Aswaja*, 3(01), 1-7. <https://doi.org/10.52188/ja.v3i01.213>
- Latifah, S. (2019). Interelasi Keterampilan Berbicara Terhadap Kemampuan Komunikasi Peserta Didik dalam Pembelajaran Bahasa Indonesia. *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Bahasa Dan Sastra Indonesia (SENASBASA)*, 3(2).
- Lestari, R. A., & Watini, S. (2023). Implementasi Model ATIK Dalam Meningkatkan Kemampuan Pra Menulis Anak Usia 4-5 Tahun Melalui Les Privat. *Aksara: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan Nonformal*, 9(1), 53–62. <http://dx.doi.org/10.37905/aksara.9.1.53-62.2023>
- Lestari, Y., Hartono, R., Yuliasri, I., & Pratama, H. (2023). Implementasi Model Pembelajaran Flipped Classroom terhadap Peningkatan Kemampuan Berbicara Siswa: A Literature Review. *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Pascasarjana (Prosnampas)*, 6(1), 939–944.
- Magdalena, I., Ulfie, N., & Awaliah, S. (2021). Analisis pentingnya keterampilan berbahasa pada siswa kelas IV di SDN Gondrong 2. *Edisi*, 3(2), 243–252.
- Mahnun, N. (2012). Media Pembelajaran (Kajian terhadap Langkah-langkah Pemilihan Media dan Implementasinya dalam Pembelajaran). *An-Nida' Jurnal Pemikiran Islam*, 37(1).
- Margareta, N. N. (2023). Analisis keterampilan berbicara siswa pada tema 6 energi dan perubahannya subtema 1 sumber energi kelas 3 SD Negeri 2 Bangoan. *E-Jurnal Inovasi Pembelajaran Sekolah Dasar*, 9(3), 35–42. <http://dx.doi.org/10.24036/e-jipsd.v9i3.10101>
- Martini, N. N., & Sueca, I. N. (2023). Penggunaan media infografis untuk meningkatkan kemampuan membaca pemahaman teks kelas X AKL 1 SMKN 1 Bangli. *Jurnal Pendidikan Deiksis*, 5(1), 13–20.

- Mediana, P. A., Latifah, N., & Muttaqien, N. (2022). Analisis kemampuan membaca pemahaman berdasarkan teori taksonomi ruddell pada siswa kelas 4 di SDN Karawaci 1. *Jurnal Pendidikan Tambusai*, 6(1), 8225–8230. <https://doi.org/10.31004/jptam.v6i1.3689>
- Megawati, N. M. P., Suarni, N. K., & Sulastri, M. (2013). Penerapan model pembelajaran talking stick berbantuan media gambar berseri untuk meningkatkan kemampuan berbahasa lisan. *Jurnal Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini Undiksha*, 1(1). <https://doi.org/10.23887/paud.v1i1.1040>
- Milla, I., Putri, S., & Muryanti, E. (2022). Efektivitas media wayang kardus terhadap perkembangan keterampilan berbicara pada anak usia dini di Taman Kanak Awalidil Jannah Timbulun. *JCE: Journal of Childhood Education*, 6(2), 2598–2184. <https://doi.org/10.30736/jce.v6i2.1090>
- Misnawati, M., Poerwadi, P., Veniaty, S., Nurachmana, A., & Cuesdeyeni, P. (2022). The indonesian language learning based on personal design in improving the language skills for elementary school students. *Multicultural Education*, 8(02), 31–39.
- Moore, P. M., Rivera, S., Bravo-Soto, G. A., Olivares, C., & Lawrie, T. A. (2018). Communication skills training for healthcare professionals working with people who have cancer. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*, 7. <https://doi.org/10.1002/14651858.CD003751.pub4>
- Mualimah, E. N., & Usmaedi, U. (2018). Pengaruh kebiasaan membaca terhadap prestasi belajar bahasa indonesia siswa kelas V SDN Kubanglaban. *JPSD: Jurnal Pendidikan Sekolah Dasar*, 4(1), 43–54. <https://doi.org/10.30870/jpsd.v4i1.2459>
- Mullis, I. V. S., Martin, M. O., Foy, P., & Drucker, K. T. (2012). PIRLS 2011 international results in reading. In *TIMSS & PIRLS International Study Center*. <https://doi.org/10.1097/01.tp.0000399132.51747.71>
- Mullis, I. V. S., Martin, M. O., & Sainsbury, M. (2015). PIRLS 2016 assessment framework. In *PIRLS 2016 Assessment Framework*.
- Nisa, R. K. (2022). Efektivitas video animasi terhadap keterampilan bercerita siswa sekolah dasar. *Seminar Nasional Hasil Riset Dan Pengabdian*, 1361–1370.
- Nur, M., Burhanuddin, B., & Mannahali, M. (2021). Hubungan antara penguasaan kosakata dengan keterampilan menulis puisi bahasa Jerman. *Interference Journal of Language, Literature, and Linguistics*, 2(1), 64–70. <https://doi.org/10.26858/interference.v1i2.14859>
- Nurhidaya, Madeamin, R., & Haslinda. (2023). Pengaruh penggunaan media buku cerita terhadap keterampilan membaca pemahaman siswa kelas IV MI Muhammadiyah Ballattabbua Kabupaten Gowa. *Compass: Journal of Education and Counselling*, 1(1).
- Nurlaily, F., & Pranata, K. (2022). Analisis Faktor-Faktor yang Mempengaruhi Rendahnya Kemampuan Menulis Peserta Didik Kelas Redah di Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Paedagogy*, 9(3), 476–485. <https://doi.org/10.33394/jp.v9i3.5297>
- OECD. (2016). *PISA 2015 assessment and analytical framework pisa 2015 assessment and analytical framework*. OECD Publishing.
- Oktaviani, N., Armariena, D. N., & Noviati. (2021). Pengaruh media pembelajaran hand puppet (boneka tangan) sebagai motivasi keterampilan bercerita siswa SD Negeri Palembang. *Didaktik: Jurnal Ilmiah PGSD FKIP Universitas Mandiri*, 9(3), 1350–1359. <https://doi.org/10.36989/didaktik.v9i3.1437>

- Park, M. Y. (2019). Challenges of maintaining the mother's language: Marriage-migrants and their mixed-heritage children in South Korea. *Language and Education*, 33(5), 431–444. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09500782.2019.1582662>
- Pradita, L. E., & Jayanti, R. (2021). *Berbahasa produktif melalui keterampilan berbicara: teori dan aplikasi*. Penerbit NEM.
- Pramesti, U. D. (2015). Peningkatan penguasaan kosakata bahasa Indonesia dalam keterampilan membaca melalui teka-teki silang (Penelitian tindakan di kelas VI SDN Surakarta 2, Kecamatan Suranenggala, Kabupaten Cirebon, Jawa Barat). *Puitika*, 11(1), 82–93. <https://doi.org/10.25077/putika.11.1.82-93.2015>
- Pranoto, B. E., & Suprayogi, S. (2020). A need analysis of esp for physical education students in Indonesia. *Premise: Journal of English Education*, 9(1), 94–110. <https://doi.org/10.24127/pj.v9i1.2274>
- Pratiwi, A. S. (2016). Penilaian Autentik dalam Pengenalan Literasi Pada Pembelajaran Bahasa Indonesia di Sekolah Dasar: Penilaian Autentik dalam Pengenalan Literasi Pada Pembelajaran Bahasa Indonesia di Sekolah Dasar. *Naturalistic: Jurnal Kajian Dan Penelitian Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran*, 1(1), 85–94. <https://doi.org/10.31949/jcp.v8i4.3069>
- Pratiwi, C. P., & Widyaningrum, H. K. (2022). Penggunaan media pembelajaran berbasis audio-visual terhadap keterampilan menulis kelas IV. *Fordetak: Seminar Nasional Pendidikan: Inovasi Pendidikan Di Era Society* 5.0, 112–119.
- Pratiwi, R. (2022). Penggunaan media audio visual berbasis animaker terhadap hasil belajar menyimak pada pembelajaran bahasa indonesia di sekolah dasar: indonesia. *Jurnal Cakrawala Pendas*, 8(4), 1247–1255.
- Pujiasti, D. A., Widyaningsih, Y. I., & Rahmayanti, M. (2022). Pengaruh media kartu gambar terhadap keterampilan berbicara siswa kelas V Sekolah Dasar. *Caxra: Jurnal Pendidikan Sekolah Dasar*, 02(01), 43–49. <https://doi.org/10.31980/caxra.v2i1.1639>
- Purnamasari, A., & Hartono, W. J. (2023). Pentingnya penggunaan bahasa indonesia di perguruan tinggi. *Jotika Journal in Education*, 2(2), 57–64. <https://doi.org/10.56445/jje.v2i2.84>
- Purwanti, K. Y., & Apriliani, E. I. (2019). Efektivitas penggunaan media big book literasi terhadap keterampilan membaca permulaan siswa kelas 1 Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Guru Kita*, 3(4). <https://doi.org/10.24114/jgk.v3i4.15089>
- Puspitasari, R. J., Hamdani, A., & Kartini, A. (2023). Pengaruh media pembelajaran cerita bergambar terhadap peningkatan keterampilan berbicara. *Caraka: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Dan Sastra Indonesia Serta Bahasa Daerah*, 12(2), 348–358.
- Qomaruddin, A. (2017). Penerapan metode bernyanyi dalam pembelajaran mufradat. *Jurnal Tawadhu*, 1(2), 272–290. <https://doi.org/10.24090/jk.v5i1.1240>
- Rachmawati, N., Marini, A., Nafiah, M., & Nurasyah, I. (2022). Projek penguatan profil pelajar pancasila dalam implementasi kurikulum prototipe di sekolah penggerak jenjang Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 6(3), 3613–3625. <https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v6i3.2714>
- Rahayu, S., & Saputra, A. (2022). Pengaruh media literasi visual dalam menulis teks pada siswa kelas IV SD Inpres Bungasunggu Kecamatan Biring Bulu Kabupaten Gowa. *Jurnal Borneo Humaniora*, 5(1), 40–44. http://jurnal.borneo.ac.id/index.php/borneo_humaniora
- Retnawati, H., Apino, E., Hasan, K., Rizqa, D., & Anazifa, D. (2018). *Pengantar analisis meta*. Parama Publishing.

- Robbaniah, A. R. D., Iskandar, S., & Nurmahanani, I. (2023). Pengaruh model pembelajaran talking stick terhadap kemampuan berbicara narasi siswa Sekolah Dasar. *Al Qodiri: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosial Dan Keagamaan*, 21(2), 903–914.
- Sadler, T. D., & Zeidler, D. L. (2009). Scientific literacy, PISA, and socioscientific discourse: Assessment for progressive aims of science education. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 46(8), <https://doi.org/10.1002/tea.20327>
- Salomon, G. (2012). *Interaction of media, cognition, and learning: An exploration of how symbolic forms cultivate mental skills and affect knowledge acquisition*. Routledge.
- Santoso, L. T. U., & Sukartiningsih, W. (2021). Pengaruh pemanfaatan media sosial tik tok terhadap keterampilan berbicara siswa kelas IV SDN Trosobo. *Jurnal Pendidikan Guru Sekolah Dasar*, 9(9), 3188–3197.
- Santy, B. I. L., Nyoman Karna, I. N., & Setiawan, H. (2022). Pengaruh media boneka tangan terhadap keterampilan berbicara siswa kelas IV SDN Tampar-Ampar Kecamatan Praya Tengah Tahun Ajaran 2020-2021. *Renjana Pendidikan Dasar*, 2(2), 139–145.
- Sareng, M. D., Puang, D. maria El, & Bunga, M. H. D. (2023). Pengaruh penggunaan media big book terhadap keterampilan membaca siswa kelas III Sekolah Dasar. *Journal On Teacher Education*, 4(3), 303–309.
- Sari, A. W. (2016). Pentingnya ketampilan mendengar dalam menciptakan komunikasi yang efektif. *EduTech: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan Dan Ilmu Sosial*, 2(1).
- Sari, D. P. (2021). Efektivitas media pop up book terhadap keterampilan membaca siswa kelas II sekolah dasar. *Jurnal Kajian Bidang Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran*, 1(1), 1–7. <https://journal.actual-insight.com/index.php/lentera/article/view/113>
- Sari, N., & Liansari, V. (2023). Pengaruh media pembelajaran pop-up book terhadap keterampilan membaca nyaring pada peserta didik sekolah dasar. *Pendas: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Dasar*, 8(1), 3020–3034. <https://doi.org/10.23969/jp.v8i1.8163>
- Saribu, A., & Hidayah, A. N. (2019). Meningkatkan kemampuan berbahasa anak melalui metode bercerita. *Jurnal Riset Golden Age PAUD UHO*, 2(1), 6–14. <https://doi.org/10.36709/jrga.v2i1.8299>
- Sela, S. A., Yulida, Y. A., Hasmi, H. S., & Sakroni, S. (2022). Meningkatkan kemampuan membaca dengan menggunakan metode multisensori vakt pada siswa sekolah dasar. *Empowerment: Jurnal Pengabdian Masyarakat*, 1(6), 781–789. <https://doi.org/10.55983/empjcs.v1i6.302>
- Sellar, S., & Lingard, B. (2014). The OECD and the expansion of PISA: New global modes of governance in education. *British Educational Research Journal*, 40(6), 917–936. <https://doi.org/10.1002/berj.3120>
- Sholihah, H. A., Koeswardani, N. F., & Fitriana, V. K. (2018). Metode pembelajaran jigsaw dalam meningkatkan keterampilan komunikasi siswa SMP. *KoPeN: Konferensi Pendidikan Nasional*, 1(1), 160–167.
- Siregar, I. (2021). The Existence of Culture in its Relevance to the Dynamics of Globalization: Bahasa Indonesia Case Study. *International Journal of Cultural and Religious Studies*, 1(1), 33–38. <https://doi.org/10.32996/ijcrs.2021.1.1.5>
- Situmorang, N. M. Y. (2018). Meningkatkan kemampuan menulis siswa kelas x aphc smk negeri 1 singaraja melalui teknik guiding questions. *Journal of Education Action Research*, 2(2), 165–171. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jear.v2i2.12190>
- Sukmadewi, P. U., & Ganing, N. N. (2020). Model pembelajaran talking stick berbantuan media buku cergam terhadap keterampilan berbicara. *Journal for Lesson and Learning Studies*, 3(2), 309–318.

- Susanti. (2016). Penerapan Metode diskusi dalam meningkatkan kemampuan berbicara siswa kelas iv sdn ogogili. *Jurnal Kreatif Tadulako Online*, 4(8).
- Susini, M., & Ndruru, E. (2021). Strategi meningkatkan kemampuan berbahasa inggris. *Linguistic Community Service Journal*, 1(2), 2021. <https://doi.org/10.22225/licosjournal.v1i2.2732>
- Suurmond, R., van Rhee, H., & Hak, T. (2017). Introduction, comparison, and validation of Meta-Essentials: a free and simple tool for meta-analysis. *Research Synthesis Methods*, 8(4), 537–553. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jrsm.1260>
- Saslim, T., Asrifan, A., Chen, Y., & Nurdania, N. R. (2019). Correlation between student's vocabulary mastery and speaking skill. *Journal of Advanced English Studies*, 2(2), 65–76. <https://doi.org/10.47354/jaes.v2i2.64>
- Troesch, L. M., Keller, K., & Grob, A. (2016). Language competence and social preference in childhood. *European Psychologist*, 21(3) <https://doi.org/10.1027/1016-9040/a000262>
- Ustari, K. S. (2018). Pengaruh Model Pembelajaran dramatic learning berbantuan boneka tangan terhadap keterampilan berbicara. *Journal of Education Technology*, 2(4), 153–159. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jet.v2i4.16427>
- Utami, R. D., Wijayanti, A., & Tanto, O. D. (2023). Peningkatan kemampuan membaca permulaan melalui kartu huruf " rasa maca" pada anak kelompok B di TK Anggrek Mangunharjo Ngawi. *Jurnal Golden Age*, 7(1).
- Wahyuni, A., Utami, A. R., & Education, E. (2021). The use of youtube video in encouraging speaking skill. *Pustakailmu.Id*, 7(3), 1–9.
- Watts, A. (2015). *International surveys: PISA, TIMSS, PIRLS*. Cambridge International Examinations.
- Widodo, S. A. (2018). Selection of learning media mathematics for junior school students. *Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology - TOJET*, 17(1), 154–160.
- Widodo, S. A., Wijayanti, A., Irfan, M., Pusporini, W., Mariah, S., & Rochmiyati, S. (2023). Effects of worksheets on problem-solving skills: meta-analytic studies. *International Journal of Educational Methodology*, 9(1), 151–167. <https://doi.org/10.12973/ijem.9.1.151>
- Wulandari, I. F., Sholeh, K., & Syaflin, S. L. (2023). Pengaruh media pembelajaran audio visual terhadap keterampilan menyimak siswa kelas III SD Negeri 81 Palembang. *Didaktik: Jurnal Ilmiah PGSD FKIP Universitas Mandiri*, 9(2), 5841–2\5853.
- Wulandari, S., Hartatik, S. F., & Ifianti, T. (2021). Efektifitas youtube sebagai media pembelajaran digital terhadap kemampuan berbicara siswa di Desa Inggris Singosari. *Prosiding Seminar Nasional IKIP Budi Utomo*, 2(01), 302–308. <https://doi.org/10.33503/prosiding.v2i01.1409>
- Yeni, I., Putra, I. E. D., & Anggraini, V. (2022). Development of minangkabau song animation media towards the development of mother's language for early childhood. *Seminar Nasional Pendidikan Pra-Munas ISPI VIII*, 64–70. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.210618.064>
- Yuliana, R. (2017). Pembelajaran membaca permulaan dalam tinjauan teori artikulasi penyerta. *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Pendidikan FKIP*, 1(2).
- Yulisa, D. (2018). Learning to listen: Listening strategies and listening comprehension of Islamic senior high school students. *Edukasi: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pengajaran*, 5(1), 22–30. <https://doi.org/10.19109/ejpp.v5i1.2046>
- Yunita, Y., Juandi, D., Hasanah, A., & Tamur, M. (2021). Studi meta-analisis: efektivitas model project-based learning terhadap kemampuan berpikir kreatif matematis

- siswa. AKSIOMA: *Jurnal Program Studi Pendidikan Matematika*, 10(3), 1382. <https://doi.org/10.24127/ajpm.v10i3.3705>
- Zafira, H., & Artharina, F. P. (2017). Pengembangan media wayang tematik pada tema indahnya negeriku sebagai pendukung scientific approach Kelas IV Sekolah Dasar. *Refleksi Edukatika: Jurnal Ilmiah Kependidikan*, (8)1. <https://doi.org/10.24176/re.v8i1.1778>
- Zein, R., & Puspita, V. (2021). Efektivitas pengembangan model bercerita terpadu terhadap kemampuan berbahasa anak usia 5-6 Tahun. *Jurnal Obsesi: Jurnal Pendidikan Anak Usia Dini*, 5(2), 2168-2178. <https://doi.org/10.31004/obsesi.v5i2.1123>
- Zubkov, A. D. (2020). Professional foreign language competence of technical students: content, structure and formation. *Integrating Engineering Education and Humanities for Global Intercultural Perspectives: Proceedings of the Conference "Integrating Engineering Education and Humanities for Global Intercultural Perspectives"*, 25-27 March 2020, St. Petersburg, Russia, 503-510. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-47415-7_53
-

Copyright Holder :

© Novi Asmarani Kusuma Dewi, et al., (2023).

First Publication Right :

© Jurnal Iqra' : Kajian Ilmu Pendidikan

This article is under:

