

Implementation of Blended Learning Model in Pancasila Education Courses in Education University of Indonesia

Rina Patriana Chairiyani^{1,2}, Dasim Budimansyah¹, Kama Abdul Hakam¹, Yadi Ruyadi¹

¹Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia, Indonesia

²Universitas Bina Nusantara, Indonesia

✉ rinapatriana@upi.edu

ABSTRACT

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received

January 04, 2023

Revised

November 23,

2023

Accepted

December 07, 2023

Blended learning is a learning method that combines direct learning (synchronous) with indirect or independent learning that can be done at anytime (asynchronous). This research aims to determine the implementation of the blended learning model in Pancasila education courses at the Indonesian University of Education. This research was conducted at the Indonesian University of Education involving 60 students. Data collection was carried out using interviews. Data analysis used qualitative descriptive analysis. The result showed that the learning process using the blended learning model basically has five important keys that must be considered in its implementation, namely 1) live events, 2) independent learning with online materials, 3) collaboration, 4) assessment, 5) performance support materials. These results showed that students are helped by blended learning, both via Zoom and YouTube.

Keywords: *Blended learning, Direct Learning, Pancasila Education Course*

Journal Homepage

<http://journal.iainnumetrolampung.ac.id/index.php/ji/>

This is an open access article under the CC BY SA license

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>

INTRODUCTION

The 21st century is a new phase in human life which is marked by advances in communication and information technology which has made the world dependent on technology and connected without borders and has become a global village (Astuti, 2017; Fajarini, 2014; Oweis, 2018). Various economic, political, social and cultural activities can occur simultaneously. The world is currently starting to enter the era of industrial revolution 4.0, which emphasizes digital economy patterns, artificial intelligence, big data, robotics, and so on or known as the phenomenon of disruptive innovation (Ristekdikti.go.id, 2018). Fundamentally, this era has resulted in changes in the way humans think, live and relate to one another. This condition will disrupt various human activities in various fields, not only in the field of technology, but also in other fields such as economics, social and political (Pratiwi et al., 2022). The digital era makes everything easier, cheaper and faster (Astuti, 2017; Wulan, N. S., et al., 2023). Dependence on digital technology in the 21st century has changed human interaction, improved the way and speed of carrying out daily activities, and increased production efficiency (Cladis, 2020).

Schwab stated that currently billions of people are connected to mobile devices, the discovery of the processing speed of internet data byte by byte, the development of the size of hard drive data storage capacity has increased the capacity of human knowledge beyond the conventional system that children get in school, how is access

to knowledge knowledge is so open that it is real, unlimited and unprecedented (Sadieda et al., 2022; Soesanto et al., 2022). The digital world means that all media can be conveyed in the form of sound, writing, symbols and even videos that can be uploaded to be shared with other parties. The spread of news or events can be easily and quickly disseminated, commented on, discussed, followed up or redistributed through other media. Digital media knows no boundaries, time and place (Astuti, 2017; Aslan, A., & Shiong, P. K. 2023). Futurologist Alvin Tofler predicted this condition in 1970 would cause a flood of information (Andiani et al., 2023).

The current abundance of information can of course be utilized for scientific and economic progress (Carman in Dakhi et al., 2020; Farooq et al., 2022; Zhang, 2018). However, if the flood of information is not used properly it will cause problems for people's social life. The flood of information received by the public through internet-based media or social media often has negative impacts that can lead to conflict, especially the spread of fake news (Astuti, 2017). The spread of fake news not only fools the public by providing incorrect information, but is also used by certain parties to incite and divide society. Over time, this will endanger the foundations of national unity (Siswoko, 2017). It can even lead this nation to disintegration or division into groups based on ethnicity, religion and race. The danger of disintegration is increasingly real because people can easily access various information via smartphone screens. People are even free to write anything, be it valid, useful information or hoax information, gossip and swearing (Astuti, 2017).

The phenomenon of deviant behavior that occurs among Indonesian teenagers regarding the use of information and communication technology (ICT) is considered a "hard slap" to educational institutions, which seem to have failed in forming a young generation that is "worthy" of being the nation's successors (Nurdin, 2017). Welcoming the 21st era a young generation is needed who is able to adapt to the challenges of change in various areas of life. This can only be produced by an education system that is suited to the 21st century ecosystem (Lestari, 2022; Mildan, 2021; Sukatin et al., 2023). Blended learning is considered important because it combines elements of online and offline learning to create a more holistic and effective learning experience. Blended learning provides flexibility to students and instructors. Students can access learning materials online, allowing them to study anytime and anywhere according to their schedule. It also gives instructors the flexibility to design more diverse learning experiences. With the online component, students can learn at their own level and style. Online learning materials can be tailored to each student's level of understanding, allowing them to overcome difficulties or progress to further material as their needs require. Blended learning can provide a balanced combination of the benefits of online and offline learning, creating a more holistic learning experience and supporting a variety of student learning styles and needs.

One innovative learning model in the context of higher education is using Blended Learning (Sahni, 2019). *Blended learning* itself is actually nothing new to the world of education. This learning model essentially combines several learning models in its application. In several distance learning organizations, for example, for a long time they have combined mixed learning through self-access content (print/Video/TV/radio) with face-to-face/telephone. Even in traditional classes, this learning model is actually implemented. To provide opportunities for students to develop themselves further, teachers often use several media such as video and audio combined with interaction in the classroom (Tait et al., 2016).

Blended Learning which is appropriate to the current context, of course different from before. In facing the era of industrial revolution 4.0, the blended learning model used is a combination of face-to-face (conventional) classes with online learning (digital). Learning is no longer bound by time and space, students and teachers can still be connected inside and outside the classroom, students can easily explore various sources using technology so that they can direct learning activities to be student-centered, learning becomes more effective and enjoyable (King, 2016). According to Carman (2005), there are five sequential stages for implementing learning using blended learning, namely live events, self-paced learning, collaboration, assessment, and performance support material.

- 1) Live Events are direct (synchronous) learning activities at a time and the same place.
- 2) Self-Paced Learning is a combination of independent learning activities (self-paced learning).
- 3) Collaboration, namely collaborative activities between educators and students and between fellow students.
- 4) Assessment is an educator's activity to determine development learning by selecting harmonious combinations from a variety online and offline assessments.
- 5) Performance Support Materials, preparing learning resources and media support in digital form that can be accessed by students.

Blended learning is an educational model that combines traditional face-to-face instruction with online or digital learning components. This approach aims to leverage the strengths of both in-person and online learning to create a more effective and flexible learning experience. Here are some key characteristics and components of a blended learning model:

- 1) Face-to-Face Instruction: Blended learning typically includes in-person classroom instruction where students interact with teachers and peers. This traditional component allows for real-time discussions, hands-on activities, and immediate feedback.
- 2) Online Learning: The online component of blended learning can take various forms, such as video lectures, interactive modules, discussion boards, and digital assessments. These resources are often accessible through a learning management system (LMS) or an online platform.
- 3) Flexibility: Blended learning provides flexibility in terms of when and where students engage with course content. They can access online materials and complete assignments outside of scheduled class times, allowing for personalized pacing.
- 4) Individualized Learning: Blended learning can support individualized or self-paced learning. Students can progress through online modules at their own speed, and educators can provide additional resources or interventions as needed.
- 5) Synchronous and Asynchronous Components: Blended learning can incorporate both synchronous (real-time) and asynchronous (self-paced) elements. For example, live virtual sessions may complement online modules, or students may engage in discussions at their convenience.
- 6) Hybrid Courses: In higher education, blended learning is often used in the form of hybrid courses, where a portion of the course is delivered online, and the rest

is conducted face-to-face. This approach can save time and resources for both students and institutions.

- 7) Technology Integration: Effective blended learning relies on the integration of technology into the learning process. This may include the use of multimedia, learning management systems, video conferencing tools, and educational apps.
- 8) Data and Analytics: Blended learning often utilizes data and analytics to track student progress and performance. Educators can use this data to identify areas where students may need additional support or to adjust instructional strategies.
- 9) Engagement and Interaction: Blended learning strives to maintain a sense of community and interaction among students and between students and instructors. This can be achieved through online discussions, group projects, and other collaborative activities.
- 10) Assessment and Feedback: Assessments may include a combination of traditional assessments (e.g., exams, quizzes) and online assessments (e.g., online quizzes, peer evaluations). Feedback mechanisms can be both automated and instructor-provided.

Blended learning models can vary widely depending on the educational level (K-12, higher education, professional development) and the specific goals of the course or program. When implemented effectively, blended learning can offer benefits such as increased flexibility, improved access to resources, enhanced engagement, and personalized learning experiences for students.

At the Indonesian University of Education, efforts are being made to apply the blended learning model to all courses, including Pancasila Education. As one of the leading educational universities in Indonesia, UPI strives to always innovate in everything, including developing technology-based learning models. Based on the background above, researchers are interested in conducting research on the blended learning model to develop critical thinking through the general Pancasila Education course at UPI.

METHOD

The research method used is qualitative research. Data collection is influenced by facts found in the field rather than theory (Creswell, W. John & Creswell, 2018). This method tells in more detail the activities that occur as a result of facts (Aspers & Corte, 2019). Therefore, qualitative research uses inductive reasoning in data analysis. This research used an interview data collection method for 60 respondents consisting of students taking Pancasila Education courses at the Indonesian University of Education.

The data analysis technique uses the Miles and Huberman model, namely data reduction, data presentation (data presentation), and drawing conclusions (Leavy, 2020). Sampling is based on purposive sampling, namely data sources based on certain considerations. Qualitative methods are a collection of methods to analyze and understand more deeply the meaning of several individuals or groups considered as humanitarian problems or social problems (Creswell, 2015). This qualitative research uses exploratory research methods. Exploration is a type of initial research of a very broad nature. In exploratory research it is very important because it will produce a strong foundation for further research.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

In the research results section, data from student interviews is presented. The report is designed in a qualitative and descriptive manner according to the results of the respondents.

Implementation of Blended Learning Model

a) Retention of material

Based on the results of the study, the student's opinion about learning via zoom meeting make them understand about the material presented by the lecturer.

"Pak supri menggunakan zoom, Sebenarnya ada factor internal external kalo internal saya bertatap layar dgn dosen cukup memahami karena dari dulu saya lebih mudah dalam memahami kalo dari external saya punya prinsip kalo mau paham saya menempatkan diri sendiri kususnya raga saya dalam posisinya yang nyaman seperti waktu SMA pun saya sering bawa bantal kecil jadi duduknya nyaman, jadi Ketika raga saya nyaman otakpun jadi mudah untuk menerima materi yg disampaikan oleh dosen. Jadi saya sangat jelas dalam memahami materi dosen di zoom/YT karena dari akumulasi nilai yang saya dapat bisa dibilang sangat bagus."

Comfort while studying can have a significant impact on understanding the learning material. Having a quiet, orderly, and comfortable study space can help focus and concentration. If someone feels happy, comfortable, and free from stress, they tend to be better at accepting and processing learning. A positive social environment, such as support from friends, family, or mentors, can provide a sense of comfort and self-confidence. Everyone has a different learning style. Finding a learning method that suits one's learning style can increase comfort and understanding. This comfort not only creates a better atmosphere for learning but can also improve retention and application of learned information. Conversely, if someone feels uncomfortable or distracted, this can hinder their ability to focus and understand the material. Therefore, it is important to create a learning environment that supports and makes students feel comfortable.

"Kalo menurut gua sendiri pembelajaran pembelajaran tatap muka daring ini juga gitu, kalo buat beberapa mata kuliah bisa aja gitu di gunain dan juga efektif gitu. Karena kan kalo mata kuliah yang full materi sama juga banyak teorinya lebih enak juga kalo medianya media kaya zoom kaya youtube karena kan kita bisa merekan terus juga ngulang-ngulang gitu kalo misalkan mata kuliahnya yang lebih banyak teori sama konsep tapi kalo mata kuliah yang ada praktiknya menurut gua masih kurang kalo misalkan kegiatannya masih tatap muka maya menurut gua gitu".

Zoom meetings are real-time face-to-face classes for speakers so they can ask questions directly to the lecturer. Through zoom meetings, interactions can be carried out more freely, thereby providing space for lecturers and students to explore learning more deeply. In this way, the desired learning outcomes can be realized. Learning to use zoom meetings or YouTube makes it easier for students to understand the material provided. Students also think that learning via Zoom or YouTube allows them to review previous learning, so they can still understand a lot of material.

"Kalo buat zoom itu pastinya lebih paham karena bisa bertanya secara real time dan langsung di jawab juga pertanyaan kita, dan dosennya ketikan ngejelasin cukup enak di mengerti jadi sebenarnya aku lebih milih ke zoom sih walaupun Cuma 3x doang zoomnya. Kalo kuliah umum aku gaterlalu merhatiin juga sih karena kalo kuliah umum

juga di perhatiin sih karena dosen ngasih kita tugas resume jadi di perhatiin. Kalo di YT suka aku ulang malahan aku suka tonton lagi setelah perkuliahannya selesai karena aku suka kadang pas lagi livenya ada kegiatan lain makanya kalo lagi di YT enak nya bisa diulang ulang sih."

Understanding the material obtained by students can occur in online learning via Zoom and YouTube. Online learning via Zoom gives students more freedom to ask questions and get direct answers, but learning via YouTube provides space to understand the material better because it can be repeated.

Dari 100% materi di zoom yang masuk Cuma kurang dari 50% karena kita musti cari lagi buat belajar dari internet karena waktu di zoom kan terbatas ga kaya kita tatap muka kalo tatap muka kita mau bertanya bisa kapan aja gitu. Kalo di kuliah umum YT paling Cuma buat nambah wawasan doang jadi Cuma di permukaan doang dan masih banyak yang gantung aja infomasinya.

Apart from those who feel comfortable with online learning, there are also those who find it difficult to follow this learning method. For example, online learning tends to reduce direct social interaction between students and teachers as well as between students themselves. Some students may be reluctant to participate in online discussions, leading to a loss of traditional classroom dynamics. Additionally Some students may have difficulty creating an effective time structure without the physical presence of teachers and classmates. Learning via Zoom/YouTube has limited supervision which can increase the risk of procrastination. To overcome these limitations, it is important to develop inclusive online learning strategies, provide adequate technical and academic support, and promote collaboration and social interaction even virtually.

Selama di perkuliahan bisa memahami dengan jelas dan baik kuliah umum atau zoom dengan dosen.

Understanding clearly whether in a public lecture or through a virtual platform like Zoom is a great achievement because many factors can influence the effectiveness of online learning. Preparation before class starts is very necessary so that the class runs smoothly, such as an internet connection and learning devices must be ready. A comfortable learning environment or place also makes the lecture process more conducive and safer. Actively participate in class discussions, either through chat or virtual raising of hands whenever possible. There are always special challenges that come with online learning, but with an organized approach and active engagement, you can maximize your learning experience, whether in public lectures or through virtual platforms.

- b) Be able to listen to the lesson better via zoom/youtube.

Based on the research results, students' opinions about listening to lessons via zoom meetings enable them to listen to the material presented by the lecturer well. Meanwhile, learning via YouTube they can hear well, but cannot interact directly.

"Untuk menyimak atau tidaknya saya tidak bisa menjawab secara pribadi tapi yang saya pahami itu bagi saya, saya menyimak karena di kelas pasti ada aja teman yang nge chat menanyakan saya soal materi dan saya bisa menjawab pertanyaan teman dengan versi saya sendiri. Jadi saya bukan mengingat apa yang dosen paparkan tetapi saya dapat menjelaskan Kembali dengan versi saya sendiri. Untuk di zoom ada interaksi saya dengan dosennya jadi ada kesempatan saya untuk bertanya ke dosen jadi gampang

untuk menjawab pertanyaan yang ada di benak saya kalau di YT itu bedanya saya dapat playback materi itu jadi saya bisa memahami dan kalau ada yang saya tidak tahu saya bisa mencari di internet."

For some students, listening to lessons from the lecturer does not require being able to repeat what the lecturer said when explaining the lesson, but they prefer to take the essence of what is conveyed and then convey it back in a version that they understand and that is easy for them to understand. In this way, they can follow and understand the learning using their own learning styles, and do not rely too much on the lecturer's words when delivering the material.

"Kalo materinya dian kurang memahami sepenuhnya cuman kalo intinya dapet gitu bu. Untuk zoom Sebagian besarnya dapet sih insyaallah jadi cukup teliti."

"Kalo menyimak gimana ya di zoom juga jarang, Karena dosen saya selalu di YT terus lama kelamaan semakin boring apalagi kalo pend. Pancasila terlalu serius jadi ketika menyimak makin lama makin boring. Sedangkan kuliah umum saya bisa menyimak dengan teliti karena ketika mendengarkan saya sembari nge resum kenapa di katakan bisa karena saya menyimak dengan fokus jadi saya bisa mngerjakan resume, dan saya biasanya masuk ke YT jadi menyimak secara teliti dan saya lebih suka yang berargumen dan diskusi"

Another opinion regarding listening to lecture material is that many students rarely pay attention when presenting the material but they prefer to be active during discussions afterwards. By discussing, they feel more able to explore things they don't understand, and there are also many other opinions that can be used as references.

Menyimak dengan teliti sih tidak terlalu karekan kan emang kalo metodenya daring mah lebih ke belajar mandiri gitu kebanyakn belajar lagi dengan sendirinya gitu, jadi cukup menyimak cuma tidak teliti juga karekan kalo online agak boring gitu juga jadi lebih enak belajar mandiri. Kalo misalkan, tergantung pematerynya juga sih kalo misalkan pematerynya seru atau dalam cara penjelasannya bisa mengajak kita buat fokus pasti kita juga fokus gitu

When learning via Zoom/YouTube, some people think that they cannot listen to lectures carefully. This is caused by various things, one of which is because they feel bored during the lecture process. So many people choose to pay attention to important things and then look for the material they need in other sources such as books or on the internet.

Ngga terlalu sih karena dari keseluruhan pertemuan tuh pasti ada aja ada gangguan atau gimana kaya kadang kalo lagi ngezoom kitanya lagi ga fit atau lagi ga mood gitu buat ngezoom atau distraksi dari orangtua disuruh apa gitu yang kelakuin dulu sedangkan kalo kuliah langsung kan ngga da distraksi karena kita di kelas gitu jadinya sulit.

Difficulties in online learning via zoom/youtube can be caused by many things. Disruptions in online classes via Zoom or other virtual platforms can be detrimental to the learning experience. These disturbances can be in the form of technical disturbances, network disturbances, audio/video disturbances, disturbances from friends, and from the learning environment.

c) The nature of the learning material

Based on the result, some students stated that the presentation of the material was logically acceptable. However, according to one source, this depends on the lecturer's personal characteristics. If the lecturer explains the material using

absurd examples or analogies, it will make the material that makes sense become unclear. Meanwhile, if the lecturer has the ability to make sense out of any abstract material, then the material can be accepted logically.

"Kalo menurut saya soal ini bukan dari instrument materinya sendiri tetapi dari pembawaan pribadi dosennya gitu bu, kaya misalkan contohnya ada satu dosen dimana beliau itu suka menganalogikan sesuatu tetapi analoginya cenderung hal yang absurd. Dosen yang kaya gitu malah membuat materi yang masuk akal menjadi menjadi materi yang tidak jelas tetapi ada juga dosen yang berkemampuan buat menganalogikan materi yang se abstrak apapun menjadi masuk akal. Kalo pend Pancasila waktu itu karena buat pak supriyono beliau selalu memberi momen untuk berdiskusi jadi meskipun ada momen dimana beliau Ketika menerangkan ada yang kurang masuk akal, dari momen diskusi itu kita sendiri bisa paham apaalagi saya sendiri suka berpendapat jadi kalau dikasih ruang untuk berpendapat saya dapat menguatkan dengan pendapat saya ke logisan dari materi tersebut. Jadi segala materi saya pasti mencari kasus dunia nyatanya."

Many factors can influence the delivery of material in lectures, one of which is the lecturer's teaching style. Some students said that whether the material presented was logical or not depended on the way the lecturer presented the material. Sometimes when giving examples you need to have good analogy skills so that it is easier for students to understand.

"Cukup logis soalnya karena materinya cukup relevan sama zaman sekarang terus ada buku panduannya lalu ada diskusinya juga walaupun ada permasalahan yang tidak ada di berita tapi tetap ada data2 dan fakta2 yang dosennya paparkan jadi cukup logis."

"Kalau sesuai logika sih iya bu tapi kita harus mencari lagi juga materinya misalkan saya baru denger suatu materi baru saya harus serching lagi jadi mencocokkan data yang ada di internet sama data yang dari dosen itu, jadi saya katakan logis karena itu bu."

"Logis ya cukup logis karekan juga menyampaikan nya juga sesuai dari sumber yang terpercaya"

Meanwhile, another opinion said that the material presented was logical because the material was relevant to the situation they were currently experiencing. This material is considered easier to understand so that students can understand the essence of what is being conveyed. On the other hand, there are those who argue that even though the material presented is logical, students must seek material from other sources to gain richer knowledge from various sources.

Dapat diterima, logis karena mulai dari mereka saat mneyampaikan materinya bisa di jelaskan secara jelasnya Kembali dan bisa kita pahami jadi sudah cukup menjelaskan.

Everyone has a different view of the delivery methods used by lecturers. The logic of the material presented also influences how the learning material is conveyed. Many students believe that the material presented is logical and understandable, so that students can improve their grades and achieve the desired grades.

Even Semester 2021/2022, the Indonesian Education University (UPI), especially the MKU lecturer team, implemented a lecture system using a blended learning model at MKU Pancasila Education. With the blended learning model, the learning system is carried out online, either synchronously (direct online learning using the Zoom Meeting application and/or other applications such as Google Meet)

or often also referred to as face-to-face lectures or asynchronous (delayed learning, meaning Learning does not have to be online but is carried out using an LMS (Learning Management System).

LMS is basically a system that facilitates the entire learning and teaching process for both instructors/teachers and students. LMS allows instructors/teachers to build and manage online learning quickly and easily. The use of an LMS can improve the delivery of material and interaction by using learning content that implicitly involves students (Alomori, 2020). The MKU lecturer team has prepared learning materials that students can access flexibly, anytime and anywhere. The LMS used in Pancasila Education lectures in the even semester 2021/2022 is spada.upi.edu. An overview of the Pancasila Education learning process can be depicted in the following table:

Table 1 Observational Data on the Pancasila Education Learning Process Using Blended Learning at UPI

No.	Observed Aspects	Observation Results
Initial activity		
1	Learning is carried out according to the specified/agreed schedule	Lectures, both synchronous and asynchronous, are held on the specified schedule, days and times.
2	The learning process is carried out synchronously/asynchronously	Lectures are held either synchronously or face-to-screen using Zoom Meeting/YouTube or asynchronously using LMS Spada.Upi.Edu
3	Apperception	The lecturer connects previously studied material with the material to be studied
Core activities		
4	Explanation of themes, subject matter, and learning objectives.	The lecturer provides an initial explanation of the subject matter and learning objectives to students
5	Use of appropriate learning media.	Pancasila education learning uses various learning media, such as audio-visual media and information technology media in the classroom learning process.
6	Use of the internet, social media in learning.	Of course, the use of the internet and social media plays an important role in the learning process.
7	Use of appropriate learning methods.	The methods used are lecture, question and answer, discussion, project based methods.

No.	Observed Aspects	Observation Results
8	Use of good and polite language.	Lecturers use good language.
9	Student activity in learning	During screen-facing (synchronous) classes, whether using zoom meetings/YouTube, students play an active role in the learning process. When the lecturer explains the material using the lecture method, students act as listeners. However, during discussion or question and answer sessions, several students actively gave opinions or answered questions. When online (asynchronous) classes use LMS, student activity can be seen from their activities in discussion forums.
10	Foster an open attitude towards student responses.	Lecturers, especially during face-to-face classes using zoom meetings/youtube, always provide opportunities for students to ask questions, give opinions or answer questions asked by the lecturer. Lecturers also always respect every question, answer or opinion submitted by students.
11	Developing a self-learning attitude	The self-learning attitude is seen when students take lectures using the LMS at Spada.Upi.Edi.
12	Fostering Critical Thinking	The learning process appears to foster students' critical thinking. Such as: students are accustomed to being given the opportunity to ask questions and give opinions, appreciate different points of view, look for other sources from existing sources in the LMS, make conclusions, etc.
Final/Closing Activities		
13	Reflect or make a summary	Students make assignments to make reflections or summaries after attending lectures, especially during public lectures via YouTube.
14	Tests (oral and written)	Tests in the form of quizzes are

No.	Observed Aspects	Observation Results
		not always given at every meeting but only at certain meetings. Meanwhile, the tests carried out as end-of-semester tests are computer based.
15	Carry out follow-up by providing direction or activities or tasks as part of remedial/enrichment or preparation for the following week's meeting	Various assignments are available on the LMS for students to complete as a follow-up to their learning.

The description of the learning process using the blended learning model basically has five important keys that must be considered in its implementation, namely:

1) Live Events (Live Events),

What is meant by live events is face-to-face learning, or synchronous direct learning led by lecturers and all students participating face-to-face at the same time and place directly in the classroom or at the same time but in different places (virtual classroom). Face-to-face learning can be used to create learning experiences that are interesting, practical and can achieve learning goals (Carman in Dakhi et al., 2020).

At MKU Pancasila Education using blended learning at UPI, live events are held during general stadium lectures, public lectures, and face-to-face classes with lecturers in charge of each class. The lecture will begin with Stadium Generale which will be held synchronously using the zoom meeting application which will be attended by all students participating in the lecture. This initial activity will contain technical provisions for using the LMS, lecture mechanisms, learning assessment, and various other important things that students must understand (spada.kemdikbud.go.id).

Next, public lectures which are regular lectures for each lecture topic. The public lecture will be held synchronously using the zoom meeting application or YouTube which will be attended by all students participating in the lecture (spada.kemdikbud.go.id). Some students who have registered (via invitation email) can take part using the zoom meeting application. If the participant quota for taking part in the zoom meeting has been used up (participant quota is usually approximately 300 participants) then students will be directed to take part in this activity using YouTube.

Public lectures will usually be filled by various speakers with areas of competence that are appropriate to the topic given. The learning method used in this session is in the form of lectures and questions and answers. Several speakers who have provided material in public lectures include: Prof. Dasim Budimansyah, Prof. Bunyamin, Prof. Kama Abdul Hakam, Dr. Yadi Ruyadi, Freddy Kalijernih, Phd., etc. The question session was conducted in two ways. For students who take lectures using Zoom meetings, they can ask questions directly or use the chat column. However, students who take lectures using YouTube can only ask questions using the chat column.

Next, the class looks at the screen together with the lecturer in charge of each class. In each class, there will usually be several face-to-face classes (1-2 times) using the Zoom Meeting or Google Meet application. The learning process for

Pancasila Education courses in face-to-face (synchronous) classes is based on observations made:

a. Lecturer activities

In lectures on the general Pancasila Education course, the lecturer begins the lesson by greeting and asking how the students are doing. Next, the lecturer carries out apperception activities by reviewing previous learning material topics. In the core activity, the lecturer provides an explanation of the material discussed. Next, the lecturer gives trigger questions to invite students to discuss or ask questions. Usually the lecturer will highlight several case studies that are currently hot and relevant to the topic of discussion.

b. Student activities

When the lecturer carries out apperception activities, students listen carefully. Furthermore, when the lecturer started explaining the material that week, the students listened carefully. Because all these activities are carried out online, it cannot be seen whether the students took notes or not the explanations given by the lecturer. For the sake of the smooth running of lectures, lecturers require students to turn on their cameras, except for those who are technically challenged. Several students actively took part in this lecture by asking questions or providing opinions/answering questions asked by the lecturer. Students can listen to each other and respect the opinions of other students. Sometimes, if there are terms/words that students don't understand, they will immediately look for an explanation on the internet. However, not all students are involved in this process. Limited physical contact due to online lectures seems to be affecting student activity.

2) Independent Learning with Online Content

Independent learning experiences can be done anytime and anywhere (Asynchronous) with online content. The learning process can be carried out using text-based or multi-time based (video, animation, simulation, images, audio, or a combination of these media), which can be accessed online (via the web or mobile device in the application: audio streaming, streaming videos, e-books that can be accessed by students anytime and anywhere), while offline in the form of CDs and materials in printed form (Carman in Dakhi et al., 2020).

At MKU Pancasila Education lectures using blended learning at UPI can be done by studying independently. Students can attend and access lectures anytime and anywhere. During the even semester 2021/2022, when the Covid-19 pandemic was hitting Indonesia, Bandung was no exception, UPI adopted a policy of eliminating face-to-face lectures in conventional (luring) classes on campus. Students then attend lectures using the blended learning model from their respective homes/boarding houses via LMS. Students carry out independent learning activities using the Spada.Upi.Edu LMS which provides digital modules, PPTs, learning videos and other relevant learning materials.

Students can study material with various available media. For students who have an audio-visual learning style, they can use PPT and learning videos to listen and study the material. Meanwhile, students who prefer to learn by reading material can use digital modules in PDF form which contain complete descriptions of the learning material. The advantage gained by studying online using an LMS is that all the material provided can be accessed at any time and can be repeated whenever students need it. Even for public lectures, because students use the social media platform YouTube, the recordings can be played back at any time.

Apart from that, the same as the activities carried out during face-to-face classes, if there are terms/words or things that students do not understand, students will search for them themselves on the internet. Sometimes students even look for information other than that provided by the lecturer or the information contained in the LMS via the internet.

Quizzes and assignments are also available in the LMS. To take the quiz, students can do it independently by accessing it via their respective LMS. The quiz questions are multiple choice with a predetermined time duration. The system will automatically assess quizzes once students complete them. Meanwhile, for assignments, students will also submit them via the LMS. Students can independently upload answers to assignments given.

3) Collaboration

In designing blended learning, an educator (lecturer/teacher) or instructor must be able to build collaboration between students and other students by using communication facilities created in the form of chatrooms, discussion forums, such as email, discussions, online chats, websites and social media, to deepening of material and solving problems or project tasks. With this collaboration, it is hoped that students' scientific insight will broaden because it involves various parties with diverse learning resources (Carman in Dakhi et al., 2020).

In MKU Pancasila Education lectures using blended learning at UPI, collaboration occurs not only between students and students but also between students and lecturers. Collaboration is carried out using communication facilities in the form of discussion forums via the Spada.Upi.Edu LMS or via social media such as WhatsApp groups to deepen material and solve problems or explain project tasks. Meanwhile, in public lectures, collaboration is carried out either directly or by using the chat room feature on YouTube. However, the weakness of using this chat room feature,

In discussion forums using LMS, lecturers will usually ask questions to stimulate discussion or provide case studies for students to respond to. Students gave their respective opinions in the discussion forum. Students can see the opinions of other friends in this discussion forum. In this way, students are accustomed to accepting different points of view from other friends. Unfortunately, discussion forums have not been fully utilized by lecturers. Lecturers usually only ask questions without a discussion process taking place. There are even lecturers who actually give assignments through discussion forums (Interview results, 2021). Meanwhile, social media such as WhatsApp groups are used as a means of supporting communication between lecturers and students or between students and students. Various announcements or information related to the course of the lecture process are also made by lecturers through this media. Collaboration between students and students actually occurs through this media (Interview Results, 2021).

4) Evaluation

In improving blended learning, an educator can combine several types of assessment, namely tests or non-tests, or authentic tests which can be expressed in the form of projects or products which can be carried out online or offline so that the assessments taken by students become more flexible. This assessment is very important to measure student knowledge. Pre-assessment can be done before face-to-face learning and independent learning to find out initial experiences and post-

assessment can be done by taking part in scheduled online learning, to measure the results of learning transfer (Carman in Dakhi et al., 2020).

When attending MKU Pancasila courses, students carry out weekly assignments including: compiling digital module resumes, video analysis, taking quizzes, sharing values for a better world and being active in virtual discussion forums. Working on a team based project as the group's final assignment. All of these assignments are assessed in the form of assignments. For the final assessment, students take the mid-semester exam and final semester exam (spada.kemdikbud.go.id).

However, during the even semester 2021/2022 the mid-semester exam took the form of a group assignment for making a film entitled "Kampung Tangguh Nusantara". The choice of topic about tough villages in the archipelago was adapted to the conditions at that time where the Covid-19 pandemic hit the whole world. Meanwhile, the final semester exam is a computer based test. Students log in via the Spada.Upi.Edu LMS to be able to take the exam. Meanwhile, quizzes are given several times in one semester. Quizzes taken by students will immediately receive an assessment automatically through the system that is available on the LMS. Other assignments such as resumes and analyzes must be corrected manually by the lecturer in charge of each class. Sadly, Based on the results of interviews with students, lecturers very rarely provide feedback on assignments that have been completed by students. Students only immediately get a final grade without knowing the details of the assessment of the assignments they have completed (Interview data, 2021).

5) Performance support materials

Material as reference material is very necessary to improve learning retention and student learning outcomes in the blended learning model. Teaching materials must be prepared in digital form and can be accessed by students both offline and online to support student competence in mastering the material (Carman in Dakhi et al., 2020). At MKU Pancasila Education, the MKU lecturer team has prepared all the necessary teaching materials, such as learning videos, material in ppt form, material in the form of modules in pdf form, etc.

Learning videos contain material related to topics in the Pancasila Education course. Usually presented by Professor Dasim Budimansyah and several MKU lecturer team lecturers, such as Mr. Supriyanto, Mrs. Rika, Mr. Dadi, etc. This learning video is short in duration but can provide knowledge and enlightenment regarding topics in the Pancasila Education course. Material in the form of PPT is the material points discussed at each meeting. Students can use it to briefly understand the material discussed in each meeting topic. Meanwhile, the overall material is contained in the module in pdf form which is also provided on the Spada.Upi.Edu LMS.

DISCUSSION

The implementation of a Blended Learning Model in Pancasila Education Courses at the Education University of Indonesia can have several potential benefits and outcomes, based on general principles of blended learning and the specific context of Pancasila education. Referring to Carman's Blended learning theory which is used as a framework, this research found five essential things. First, from live events, the policy at MKU Pancasila Education using blended learning allows holding live events during lectures, public lectures and face-to-face classes with lecturers in charge of each class.

Second, independent learning with online content can be carried out consistently anytime and anywhere according to individual needs. Third, collaboration is needed in planning and designing learning with blended learning, this can be done together with students either directly or online. Fourth, the blended learning model assessment process can be adjusted by the lecturer, either pre-tested or non-tested, or in the form of a project given to students being assessed. Fifth, the material presented needs to be studied so that it can be used as reference material to improve learning retention and also student learning outcomes.

Blended learning platforms often collect data on student performance and engagement. This data can be used to identify areas where students may be struggling and provide targeted support. It also helps instructors continually improve the course. While implementing a blended learning model may require an initial investment in technology and training, it can lead to cost savings over time. For example, fewer physical resources may be needed, and it can accommodate larger class sizes. It's important to recognize that implementing a blended learning model also comes with challenges. Faculty and students may need training and support to adapt to this new mode of instruction. Ensuring equitable access to technology and addressing potential issues with digital divide should also be considered. In Pancasila education, which focuses on teaching ethical and moral values, it is crucial to ensure that the blended learning model does not compromise the quality of moral and ethical discussions and interactions that are typically part of such courses. Careful course design and thoughtful integration of online and face-to-face components are necessary. Assessing students in a blended learning environment may require different strategies and tools. The university should consider how assessment methods align with the blended learning approach and ensure that they effectively measure the desired learning outcomes.

In recent years, blended learning combines traditional face-to-face instruction with online components, allowing students to access resources and engage with course materials at their own pace. This can lead to a more personalized and engaging learning experience for students. Blended learning provides flexibility for students, allowing them to access course materials and resources remotely (Sharlovych et al., 2023). This can be particularly valuable for students with busy schedules or those who may face geographical constraints. The integration of online tools, multimedia resources, and interactive activities can enhance student engagement (Purnama et al., 2023). It may make the content more accessible and relatable, especially for younger generations who are familiar with digital technologies. Meanwhile, another study from Basori (2023) found that three types of BL were: i) The flipped classroom model; ii) The station-rotation model; and iii) The self-blend model. BL syntax that teachers most favored in nine ways, but mainly with the syntax: "Face-to-face (F2F) finished, after that online learning for enrichment". Meanwhile, most of the articles improved learning outcomes in the cognitive domain.

This research also discusses the use of LMS in the lecture environment same as research findings from Andiani (2023) who found Learning Management Systems (LMS) and Information and Communications Technology (ICT)-based support this blended learning. . LMS (Learning Management System), the eLearning platform, was extensively used for flipped classroom and other activities which were applied in Organizational Behavior course throughout one semester (16 weeks). Multiple sources were used for data collected; focus-group interviews; student surveys and LMS records (Sahni, 2019). In other research, LMS used as an evaluation tool and observation tool of

the learning process through e-learning. Second, the implementation of blended learning models could improve the critical thinking skills in learning history through three cycles. Third, the obstacle emerged in this study was particularly the technical constraints on the essay assignment that must be collected online which is overcome by using a CD (Makmur, 2017). Correspondingly, the BL learning model is described as a learning model that combines face-to-face learning through specific online platforms and non-face-to-face learning using the LMS (Learning Management System) (Fadillah, Nopitasari, & Pradja, 2020).

Furthermore, Digital learning is everything that teachers must prepare before carrying out the learning process. Teachers are expected to be able to conduct the learning process so that the planned educational goals can be met (Yaniawati et al., 2023). According to Rachman's research, technological developments that are increasing in various aspects of life have opened many opportunities to meet the needs of information technology to support learning activities. Digital Learning materials are systematically arranged in the form of information or texts that include competency standards to be mastered by students, in each subject and academic unit (Wang, 2021). The sense of conclusion to be drawn that the Blended learning combines online learning with traditional media in the form of face-to-face (Sulistiani, 2016).

For the success of the learning model, this research emphasizes the importance of preparing learning carefully, both material and assessment, therefore collaboration is needed. The ultimate goal of collaboration is to provide real world scenarios where the participants can gain hands-on experience, practice their theoretical knowledge, and polish the skills like problem identification, planning, communication, teamwork, collaboration which are the significant skills of project management (Farooq et al., 2022). The feedback from the peers and the instructors helps in identifying one's mistakes. The real time experimentation and feedback drive the whole operation (Rahman, 2020). Principally, the design of the scenarios, experience of the participants, runtime decisions, amendments in the program and general evolutions of concepts have been set off in the research articles. Meanwhile, the benefits of blended learning according to Yendri (2011), are (1) improve learning outcomes through distance learning ; (2) increase the ease of learning so that students become complacent in studying through distance education; (3) reducing the cost of learning. This is because According to Thorne (2003), Blended learning is a combination of: multimedia technology, CD ROM video streaming, virtual classroom, voicemail, email, and telephone conferencing, online text animation and video streaming. All of this is combined with traditional forms of classroom training and one-on-one training (Yaniawati, 2023).

This research has implications for improving the quality of MKU Pancasila Education lectures through learning with an integrated blended learning model in supporting the realization of the university motto and national education goals. The use of the blended learning model has an influence on the systematicity of lectures. First, Blended learning can increase student engagement by providing a diverse and flexible learning platform. Learners may be more engaged in learning material through a combination of online and offline sessions. This model also provides space for students to access learning materials anytime and anywhere, increasing flexibility in learning. Second, the implementation of blended learning may require adjustments in curriculum design and technological infrastructure development. Support and training are needed to ensure that instructors and students can utilize technology effectively.

This research is limited to the blended learning model which is integrated into MKU Pancasila Education lectures. So that future research projects can be expanded to look at other models that have an impact on lectures. To study this, further research can broaden the research focus by using other models that are widely used in the lecture process both at UPI and other universities.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the implementation of a blended learning model in Pancasila Education Courses at the Education University of Indonesia has the potential to offer a more flexible, engaging, and data-driven educational experience. However, its success will depend on careful planning, faculty training, ongoing evaluation, and a commitment to maintaining the core principles of Pancasila education within the digital context. As a stepping stone for further research, researchers suggest maximizing lecture preparation and design to maximize BL implementation. Apart from that, there is a need to develop the competence of educators towards mastering technology in learning.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I would like to express my gratitude to the Education University of Indonesia for giving permission, time and information related to the research that I have done. Especially to the students in Pancasila Education courses, who have accepted me to do research and students who are the object of research.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTION STATEMENT

Rina Patriana Chairiyani (RPC) conducted research, implementation, and evaluation of research. Discussed designing research, conducting data validity tests, collecting data, processing research results and analysing the data obtained.

REFERENCES

- Andiani, Ibrahim, N., & Rusmono. (2023). Improving Calculus Learning Outcomes Using Structured Assignment Methods-Based Modules. *International Journal of Information and Education Technology*, 13(6). <https://doi.org/10.18178/ijiet.2023.13.6.1883>
- Aspers, P., & Corte, U. (2019). What is Qualitative in Qualitative Research. *Qualitative Sociology*, 42(2). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11133-019-9413-7>
- Aslan, A., & Shiong, P. K. (2023). Learning in the Digital Age Full of Hedonistic Cultural Values Among Elementary School Students. *Bulletin of Pedagogical Research*, 3(2), 94-102. <https://doi.org/10.51278/bpr.v3i2.515>
- Astuti, Y. (2017). Peperangan Generasi Digital Natives Melawan Digital Hoax Melalui Kompetisi Kreatif. *Informasi*, 229 - 242. <https://doi.org/10.21831/informasi.v47i2.16658>
- Bahmani, S. (2016). Improved Critical Thinking in Students Using Current Events Journaling. *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, 1 -17. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJSSP-04-2015-0038>
- Bandyopadhyay, S., & Szostek, J. (2018). Thinking critically about critical thinking: Assessing. *Journal of Education for Business*, 1-12.
- Bandyopadhyay, S., & Szostek, J. (2018). Thinking critically about critical thinking: Assessing critical thinking of business students using multiple measures. *Journal of Education for Business*, 1 - 12.

- <https://doi.org/10.1080/08832323.2018.1524355>
- Cladis, A. E. (2020). A shifting paradigm: An evaluation of the pervasive effects of digital technologies on language expression, creativity, critical thinking, political discourse, and interactive processes of human communications. *E-Learning and Digital Media*, 17(5), 341-364. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2042753017752583>
- Cobo, C. (2013). Skills for innovation: envisioning education that prepares for the changing world. *The Curriculum Journal*, 67 - 85. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09585176.2012.744330>
- Creswell, W. John & Creswell, J. D. (2018). Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches. In *Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling* (Fifth Edit, Vol. 53, Issue 9). SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Dakhi, O., Jama, J., Irfan, D., Ambiyar, & Ishak. (2020). Blended learning: a 21st century learning model at college. *International Journal Of Multi Science*, 1(7), 50-65.
- Facione. (2020). *Critical Thinking: What It Is and Why It Counts*. Retrieved from insightassessment.com: <https://www.insightassessment.com/wp-content/uploads/ia/pdf/whatwhy.pdf>
- Fadillah, A., Nopitasari, D., & Pradja, B. P. (2020). Blended Learning Model During the Covid-19 Pandemic: Analysis of Student's' Mathematical Disposition. *Jurnal Teori dan Aplikasi Matematika*, 4(2), 173-181 <https://doi.org/10.31764/jtam.v4i2.2582>
- Farooq, M. S., Hamid, A., Alvi, A., & Omer, U. (2022). Blended Learning Models, Curricula, and Gamification in Project Management Education. *IEEE Access*, 10. <https://doi.org/10.1109/ACCESS.2022.3180355>
- Foo, S. Y., & Quek, C. L. (2019). Developing Students' Critical Thinking through Asynchronous Online Discussions: A Literature Review. *Malaysian Online Journal of Educational Technology*, 7(2), 37-58. <https://doi.org/10.17220/mojet.2019.02.003>
- Franco, A., Marques Vieira, R., & Tenreiro-Vieira, C. (2018). Educating for critical thinking in university: The criticality of critical thinking in education and everyday life. *ESSACHESS - Journal for Communication Studies*, 11(2), 131-144.
- Ghiffar, M. A., Nurisma, E., Kurniasih, C., & Bhakti, C. P. (2018). Model Pembelajaran Berbasis Blended Learning Dalam Meningkatkan Critical Thinking Skills Untuk Menghadapi Era Revolusi Industri 4.0. *Seminar Nasional Pendidikan* (pp. 19 - 27). Sulawesi Selatan: Jurnal STKIP Andi Matappa Pangkep.
- Hartnett, M., Carvalho, L., Lamond, H., Murray, F., O'Hara, D., & Fields, A. (2018). Inhabiting the Multiple Places, Spaces, and Time for Learning. *Journal of Open, Flexible and Distance Learning*, 1 - 9. <https://doi.org/10.61468/jofdl.v22i2.348>
- Hohmann, J. W., & Grillo, M. C. (2015). Using Critical Thinking Rubrics to Increase Academic Performance. *Journal of College Reading and Learning*, 35 - 51. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10790195.2014.949551>
- Iswan, & Herwina. (2018). Penguatan Pendidikan Karakter Perspektif Islam. *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Pendidikan Era Revolusi* (pp. 21- 42). Jakarta: Universitas Muhammadiyah.
- Johanns, B., Dinkens, A., & Moore, J. (2017). A Systematic Review Comparing Open-Book and Closed-Book Examinations: Evaluating Effects on Development of Critical Thinking. *Nurse Education in Practise*, 89 - 94. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nepr.2017.08.018>
- Kock, N., Del Aquila-Obra, A. R., & Padilla-Melendez, A. (2011, January). *The*

- Information Overload Paradox. Retrieved from Researchgate.net: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/281900511_The_Information_Overload_Paradox
- Leavy, P. (2020). The oxford handbook of qualitative research: Second edition. In *The Oxford Handbook of Qualitative Research*. <https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780190847388.013>
- Lestari, I. D. (2022). Implementasi Model Pembelajaran Blended Learning di TKIT Al Fatah. *Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan (JIP) STKIP Kusuma Negara*, 13(2). <https://doi.org/10.37640/jip.v13i2.1036>
- Mildan, A. R. (2021). Implementasi Model Pembelajaran Blended Learning Pada Mata Pelajaran PAI. *Permata: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 2(2). <https://doi.org/10.47453/permata.v2i2.502>
- Nurdin, E. S. (2017). *Teori-Teori Analisis Implementasi Kebijakan Publik*. Bandung: Maulana Media Grafika.
- Oweis, T. I. (2018). Effects of Using a Blended Learning Method on Students' Achievement and Motivation to Learn English in Jordan: A Pilot Case Study. *Education Research International*, 2018. <https://doi.org/10.1155/2018/7425924>
- Prasetyo, B., & Trisyanti, U. (2018). Revolusi Industri 4.0 dan Tantangan Perubahan Sosial. *IPTEK Journal of Proceeding Series* (pp. 22-27). Surabaya: Institut Teknologi Sepuluh November.
- Pratiwi, S. N., Prasetya, I., & Gaja, N. (2022). Literacy Culture in Elementary Schools: The Impact of the Literacy Movement Program and Library Facilities. *Jurnal Kependidikan: Jurnal Hasil Penelitian Dan Kajian Kepustakaan Di Bidang Pendidikan, Pengajaran Dan Pembelajaran*, 8(3). <https://doi.org/10.33394/jk.v8i3.5559>
- L. A. Rachman et al., "The blended learning implementation of ELT based on teachers' and students' perspective in new normal condition of covid 19," *Professional Journal of English Education*, vol. 4, no. 3, pp. 457-468, 2021.
- Ristekdikti.go.id. (2018, Januari 30). *Era Revolusi Industri 4.0, Saatnya Generasi Millennial Menjadi Dosen Masa Depan*. Retrieved from Sumberdaya.ristekdikti.go.id: <http://sumberdaya.ristekdikti.go.id/index.php/2018/01/30/era-revolusi-industri-4-0-saatnya-generasi-millennial-menjadi-dosen-masa-depan/>
- Sadieda, L. U., Wahyudi, B., & Kirana, R. D. (2022). Implementasi Model Blended Learning Pada Pembelajaran. *Jurnal Review Pembelajaran Matematika*, 7(1).
- Sahni, J. (2019). Does Blended Learning Enhance Student Engagement? Evidence from Higher Education. *Journal of E-Learning and Higher Education*, 2019, 1-14. <https://doi.org/10.5171/2019.121518>
- Soesanto, R., Bermuli, J., & Mumu, B. (2022). Implementation of Blended Learning Models during the Pandemic. *EDUTECH: Journal of Education And Technology*, 5(4). <https://doi.org/10.29062/edu.v5i4.362>
- Sukatin, Mahdayeni, Ginanjar, A., Fatonah, N., Meiliani, E., & Fami. (2023). Blended Learning Model to Improve Learning Independence of University Students. *Al-Ishlah: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 15(1). <https://doi.org/10.35445/alishlah.v15i1.2394>
- Siswoko, K. (2017). Kebijakan Pemerintah Menangkal Penyebaran Berita Palsu atau 'Hoax'. *Muara*, 13 - 19. <https://doi.org/10.24912/jmishumsen.v1i1.330>
- Suryadi. (2018, September 20). *Dunia Pendidikan dan Tantangan Guru di Era Digital*. Bandung, Jawa Barat, Indonesia.
- Tait, P., Saunders, C., Guenther, M., Rutherford, P., & Miller, S. (2016). Exploring the impacts of food label format on consumer willingness to pay for environmental sustainability: A choice experiment approach in the United Kingdom and

- Japan. *International Food Research Journal*, 23(4).
- T. Wang. 2021. "A blended collaborative teaching mode in language learning based on recommendation algorithm," *International Journal of Emerging Technologies in Learning*, 16 (23), pp. 111-126, <https://doi.org/10.3991/ijet.v16i23.27253>
- Wulan, N. S., Putri, H. E., Rahayu, P., Suwangsih, E., Ruswan, A., Mulyani, S., ... & Fajrussalam, H. (2023). Pelatihan Pembelajaran Berbasis 21st Century Skills di Sekolah Indonesia Johor Bahru Malaysia. *Bulletin of Community Engagement*, 3(2), 97-108. <http://dx.doi.org/10.51278/bce.v3i2.583>
- Zhang, J. (2018). Blended learning innovation model among college students based on internet. *International Journal of Emerging Technologies in Learning*, 13(10). <https://doi.org/10.3991/ijet.v13i10.9454>
- Zivkovic, S. (2016). A Model of Critical Thinking as an Important Attribute for Success in the 21st Century. *International Conference on Teaching and Learning English as an Additional Language* (pp. 102 - 108). Antalya, Turkey: Procedia- Social and Behavioral Sciences <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2016.10.034>
- Zivkovic, Z. (2016). A Model of Critical Thinking as an Important Attribute for Success. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 102-108. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2016.10.034>
-

Copyright Holder :

© Rina Patriana Chairiyani, et al., (2023).

First Publication Right :

© Jurnal Iqra' : Kajian Ilmu Pendidikan

This article is under:

